

226 228 232 West Maxwell Street
South Hill Historic District

Jerrad Howard, Owner
Bob Carbon, Applicant

Scope of Work

Construct three detached single-family Residences.

Background

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct three single family residences with detached garages. The site of this proposal is the parking lot across West Maxwell Street that has been used by the Dudley's restaurant. The proposed façade of the residences is oriented to South Mill Street with the side elevation oriented to West Maxwell Street. The lots are proposed to be thirty feet wide by 150 feet deep. The structures are proposed to be three stories with four bedrooms, 4 ½ baths and full basements. The footprint of each garage is proposed to be twenty-four feet wide by fifty-four feet deep. The free-standing garages are approximately twenty-four-foot square and will be accessed from Lawrence Street. The applicant has been in conversations with the LFUCG Planning Department to apply for a downzone from C- Commercial to single family R-1. The properties will also have to be readdressed from West Maxwell to South Mill Street

The architectural description of the proposed residences is as follow:

1. The West Maxwell (north) elevation will present a three-story brick wall with a false front above the roof line as the primary mass with single and paired windows. Towards the front wall there is a large rectangular bay with multiple windows. The bay is sided with paneled cementitious board panels and details such as band boards and crowned fascia. The rear two-story elevation is sided in cementitious with a second-floor open porch with a hip roof.
2. The South Mill Street (west) façade has masonry veneer that rises to the top of the second floor where the mansard type battered wall of the third floor is covered with "slate-look" shingles and a paired and single window. Toward the south side of the façade a recessed door which is surrounded by a stone veneer is located at the first-floor level. The Maxwell elevation has a similar bay. The third-floor battered mansard wall is topped by a low slope gable roof that is roofed with a membrane roofing material.
3. The rear elevation (east) as described before in the north façade description is a two-story mass with a hip roof. The fenestration of the two-story rear elevation has two pairs of windows and glass doors. The glass doors are located on the first floor. The mansard/ battered wall as described for the front façade is visible above the two-story mass and includes a single window and a set of paired windows.
4. The south elevation is again masonry veneer similar to the north elevation, but without the details and fenestration because of its requirement to be a firewall.

Background (cont'd).

5. The proposed garages have a similar but less detailed design as the proposed residences.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very

Guidelines (cont'd).

- important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components. Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.

Guidelines (cont'd).

- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
 - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
 - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good "sense of belonging" on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).
- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

2.New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Guidelines (cont'd).

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Findings

As this is a conceptual review staff does not have any findings at this time, although, staff has created a series of questions the Board may be interested in discussing.

1. Is it appropriate to construct three new single-family structures that would have the façade front on South Mill Avenue and present the side elevation to West Maxwell Street?
2. Would the construction of three new residences and garages have a negative impact to the historic character of the property that is in question or the South Hill Historic District?
3. Is the scale mass and form in keeping with the scale mass and form of the historic structures located within the south Hill Historic District?
4. Would the construction of three new residences and garages have a negative impact to the historic density of the property that is in question or the South Hill Historic District?
5. Does the third floor with its battered walls and roof design mimic a historic mansard roof and speak to the current design trend for new construction?
6. Would the design of the elevations at the third-floor level be better served if the exterior material was a type of siding currently in modern construction and not a reproduction/synthetic slate?
7. Should the main gable roof have a steeper pitch to allow for the use of composite shingles instead of a membrane roof?

Recommendations

As this is a conceptual review staff does not have any recommendations currently.

Deadline for Board Action

None currently.