

141 South Hanover Avenue
Ashland Park Historic District

Henry and Barbara Hinkle, Owner
Thomas Wilmes, Applicant

Scope of work

Construct carport addition

Background

At this time, the owner is requesting that the Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a carport addition in front of the existing one-story, two-bay, brick masonry garage. The proposal calls for the following:

1. The replacement of the existing garage doors of the existing garage.
2. Construction of a standing seam metal hip roof, the existing garage roof has tile.
3. Construction of a low-pitch connector roof having a membrane roof. This connects to the existing garage.
4. The roof will be supported by 6, wrapped 10” by 10” columns.
5. A small gable roof over the existing turnabout will “t” into the proposed roof and also be supported by similar size columns.

Part of the proposal calls for the existing retaining wall to be further recessed expanded and rebuilt the retaining wall.

The garage doors have been replaced before and the proposal now calls for the removal of the middle post to make one large bay. The doors will be replaced so that they have glass at the top with panels below.

Guidelines

10. Garages and outbuilding

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Many Lexington-Fayette County properties retain original or added outbuildings. In addition to principal structures, rural and urban areas have a secondary network of smaller buildings and support structures located in backyards, on alleys, and throughout farm complexes. These buildings served a wide variety of purposes including carriage houses, barns, stables, kitchens, gazebos, smokehouses, tenant and alley houses, privies, and other farm structures. Outbuildings in the rural sections of the county are important features in defining the historic growth and development of farmsteads and country houses. Accessory structures contribute to the character of the principal structure, site, streetscape, and historic district and should be preserved and maintained as long as feasible. These accessory structures vary greatly in appearance and materials. Rehabilitation of accessory structures should follow design guidelines established for the rehabilitation of principal structures.

Garages and Outbuildings:

Guidelines (cont'd)

- A. that contribute to a property's historic character or are original to a property should be preserved and maintained. Significant or historic features such as siding and windows should be repaired or replaced to match the original.
- B. original to a property should not be moved or relocated to another part of the lot.
- C. original doors such as early 20th century garage doors should be maintained to the greatest extent possible but may be retrofitted with modern hardware and custom garage door openers.

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- *Entrances and divisional bays:* Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- *Brick Structures:* If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
 - *Foundations:* Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- *Frame Structures:* If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - *Porches and Decks:* Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - *Windows:* The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good "sense of belonging" on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).
- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds. New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. GUIDELINES FOR SITE AND SETTING

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property's historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

6. LANDSCAPE, LAND FEATURES, LAND FORMATIONS, VIEWSHEDS
AND ARCHAEOLOGY

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Landscape, land features, land formations, view sheds and archaeology define many site elements in historic areas throughout Fayette County. These elements include resources above and below the ground surface. As a result, landscape and land features are more difficult to define than built features and elements. Landscape and land features can be either man-made or natural. These features include, but are not limited to: trees and shrubs, decorative gardens, utilitarian (functional) gardens, fields, documented historic topography, archaeological and cultural resources and other land features and land formations.

Landscape, Land Features, Land Formations, Viewsheds and Archaeology:

- A. that are significant should be preserved and maintained.
- B. that are altered or introduced should be compatible to the site and with surrounding properties.
- C. should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.

Findings

The proposal to construct the carport addition onto this existing garage is found to be within Guidelines II.B.2.F., "Carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property." Staff finds the roof should be lowered to a 3:12 pitch in lieu of a 6:12 in order to expose more of the original garage.

The proposal to replace the garage doors is within the Guidelines. The garage doors have already been altered and proposal to replace them are within the "Design Principle states New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller".

Findings (cont'd)

Per the change in the retaining wall, the Guidelines for site and setting Design Principle states, "Landscape and land features are more difficult to define than built features and elements." Staff finds the retaining wall has already been altered and rebuilt and further change will not disturb original built walls.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the construction of the carport, replacement of garage door and change of retaining wall with the following conditions.

1. The carport roof be lowered to a 3:12 and final details come back to staff.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, resubmit any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of issuance of a COA.
3. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.

Deadline for Board Action
May 1, 2024