

109 Constitution Street  
Mulberry Hill Historic District

Chad Needham Properties, Owner/ Applicant

Scope of Work  
Change opening.

Background

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove pair of windows, replace the windows with a smaller window and to add a second door to allow for a dedicated ADA compliant entrance. The windows and door that are proposed to be changed are located in the rear of a later concrete masonry unit addition that faces onto Academy Alley.

Guidelines

- I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation
- 7. Doors

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: As points of entry, doors and door surrounds are important features in defining the style and character of a building. Significant doors should be preserved and maintained and significant features should be repaired rather than replaced.

Doors:

- (I.7.)A. and/or their surrounds, sidelights, transoms, and detailing should not be removed or altered if significant to the building. Original framing such as jamb, sill, and headers of openings should be retained/maintained.
- B. that cannot be repaired or that are missing may be replaced. Replacement doors should match the historic door in materials and size, and should be appropriate for the style and period of the building. They should have the same series of panels and have a frame of the same dimensions. Door replacement should be based on documented research and/or historic photographs. Neighboring buildings of the same style and similar date of construction may provide guidance for identifying appropriate doors. In replacing missing original doors, replacement doors should be similar in design to the original in style, materials, glazing (glass area) and lights (pane configuration).
- C. and door units that are standard may be permitted with no more than a 1” width and height variance from historic openings.
- D. openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is allowed by the BOAR, infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2” to 6” back from the building face.
- E. installing new door openings is not recommended. New openings, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on side or rear elevations rather than the main façade.

Guidelines Cont'd.

24. Windows

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Windows:

- A should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.
- E in new openings are not recommended. New openings, when permitted by the review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary façade.
- F and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the face of the building.

Guidelines Cont'd.

- G of steel or other metal designs and that are historic should be preserved and maintained or replaced with new metal windows. Replacement windows should match historic metal windows as closely as possible in size, material, and design.
- H should use appropriate burglar guards that fit within the window frame.

Findings

Staff finds that the proposal to change the size of the windows and to add a door in the rear of the later addition meets the Guidelines. Guideline I.7.E. states “installing new door openings is not recommended. New openings, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on side or rear elevations rather than the main façade.” The change of the windows and addition a door in the rear elevation meets Guideline I.24.F., windows “and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2” to 6” back from the face of the building.” The change of the windows to a door in the later non-significant CMU addition will to allow for an ADA compliant entry will not have a negative impact to the structure or the Mulberry Hill Historic District.

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, return any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for BOAR Action

July 17, 2022