

179 Old Park Avenue
Aylesford Historic District

Fernando Perez, Owner & Applicant

Scope of Work

Restore front porch; construct side porch, rear addition and stoop; enlarge basement openings.

Background

The new owners of this turn of the century structure are working on restoring this structure. Mr. Perez received several COA's to make repairs to the structure.

They are requesting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the following work:

1. Restore/reconstruct front porch.
2. Restore/reconstruct side porch.
3. Construction rear addition and stoop
4. Enlarge basement entrances.

The proposal calls to demolish the existing front porch and reconstruct a front porch that spans across the main roof. It will have a low slope roof with a box gutter and tuck under the existing eaves. The columns will be 10' round columns supported by brick piers a tongue and groove wood floor with a bead board ceiling. The porch skirting will be horizontal lattice. According to notes on the plans the porch is being designed based upon an image from the 1970s.

This structure lost its side porch quite a while ago. The proposal calls to install a covered stoop having a 6' by 3' wood porch with wood steps leading down the driveway. The proposed roof awning would extend over the stoop and the HVAC. It is proposed to be at cornice line between the two side projecting bays.

The third addition/porch proposal calls for the removal of a rear stoop and the construction of a one-story rear addition having the approximate dimensions of 30' by 12'. The addition will consist of a clapboard and shake siding addition with a combination of fixed and casement windows. This addition will be supported by piers and cover a concrete pad that serves the walkout basement door. There will be a full light side door leading to an exterior stoop and steps with a contemporary flare.

Lastly, the proposal calls for the expansion of basement with living space, laundry room, bedrooms and bathrooms. To make this happen the plan calls to replace and lengthen two basement windows and the replacement of the rear basement door.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

1. Architectural Details and Features

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
- B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
- C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
- D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
- E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
- F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

7. Doors

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: As points of entry, doors and door surrounds are important features in defining the style and character of a building. Significant doors should be preserved and maintained and significant features should be repaired rather than replaced.

Doors:

- (I.7.)A. and/or their surrounds, sidelights, transoms, and detailing should not be removed or altered if significant to the building. Original framing such as jamb, sill, and headers of openings should be retained/maintained.

Guidelines cont'd

- B. that cannot be repaired or that are missing may be replaced. Replacement doors should match the historic door in materials and size, and should be appropriate for the style and period of the building. They should have the same series of panels and have a frame of the same dimensions. Door replacement should be based on documented research and/or historic photographs. Neighboring buildings of the same style and similar date of construction may provide guidance for identifying appropriate doors. In replacing missing original doors, replacement doors should be similar in design to the original in style, materials, glazing (glass area) and lights (pane configuration).
- C. and door units that are standard may be permitted with no more than a 1" width and height variance from historic openings.
- D. openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is allowed by the BOAR, infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the building face.
- E. installing new door openings is not recommended. New openings, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on side or rear elevations rather than the main façade.

3. Porches

Design Principle: Porches are often prominent features of a building and help establish scale, proportion, and rhythm along streetscapes. Construction of a porch on an existing building should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings and the district. Porches should be in keeping with the principal structure's architectural style and not reflect an earlier period style.

Porches:

- A. should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and within the district.
- B. should be compatible with the principal structure's architectural style, and not be of an earlier architectural period.
- C. that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.

24. Windows

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Guidelines cont'd

Windows:

- A should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.
- E in new openings are not recommended. New openings, when permitted by the review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary façade.
- F and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the face of the building.
- G of steel or other metal designs and that are historic should be preserved and maintained or replaced with new metal windows. Replacement windows should match historic metal windows as closely as possible in size, material, and design.
- H should use appropriate burglar guards that fit within the window frame.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

1. Decks/Patio/Verandas/Balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Guidelines cont'd

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to match. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)
- C. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
- D. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
- E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.
- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building

Guidelines cont'd

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington’s historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
 - Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as

Guidelines cont'd

- pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
- Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
- Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance.
- Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.

Findings

The concept of rebuilding the front and side porches are within the Guidelines. Guidelines I.1. A., C, I.14. D., and E which respectively state. “Architectural Details shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building” and “If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.” Staff has found an image with the porch across the front of the structure. In addition, there is ghosting on the front projecting bay. In addition, Sanborn maps indicate front porch and side porches on this structure. The Design Principle states, “Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building’s historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.” Staff examined aerials, Sanborn Maps and previous building inspection records and determined previous porch locations.

Guidelines cont'd

The proposal to use fiberglass columns is within the Guidelines I.14.C which states, "Porch Columns and railings...if replacement of wood columns is necessary, wood is the preferred material. In some material, however, fiberglass may be considered for the column shaft. Fiberglass bases and caps are acceptable." The railing details are appropriate. Guidelines I.14. E states, "Porch Columns and Railings on front porches should be rebuilt in historic designs if there is documentation of the original columns and railings. Columns, balustrades, and railing should be appropriately scaled for the scale of the porch. PVC and/or composite materials are not permitted".

The proposal to construct a rear addition is within the Guidelines. Guidelines II.A.4.C., II.A.4.E.and II.A.4.I respectively state, "Additions should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice height.", "Additions should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building" and "Additions should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions."

The proposal to extend the openings along the basement is within the Guidelines. Guidelines II.B.II.F. ... "Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district."

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval of the proposal with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes shall be returned to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for BOAR Action

August 8, 2022