

584 West Third Street  
Western Suburbs Historic District

Kevin McGuire, applicant and Owner

Scope of Work

Reside addition and change openings.

Background

At this time the applicant is requesting that the Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to conduct the following work:

1. Re-clad existing concrete block addition on east side of building with clapboard siding; including removal of side addition windows.
2. Change roof pitch of existing side addition.
3. Remove side windows on addition.
4. Change openings and remove a rear and front door to the addition,
5. Create a new entrance in previously erected addition.

The applicant has an existing concrete block 4' by 34' side addition. It has a front and rear entrance into the addition. The applicant is proposing to re-clad the concrete block with vertical fiber cementitious siding which entails covering windows on part of the later addition. He would propose to change the roof pitch from a 3:12 pitch roof to a .5:12 pitch roof and cover it with a single membrane roof. The proposal calls for the change from the single front door to a full light glazed store front. This would involve removing the steps leading to this door and replacing the material below the opening to shiplap siding. The rear wall of this addition will also have the same treatment as the front and have a full light glazed store front.

The plans call for the new door to be installed in a previously constructed addition. The proposed door will lead on to the rear stoop. The new stoop will also be accessed by existing sliding glass door in another part of the existing addition.

Guidelines

4. ROOM AND WING ADDITIONS

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.*

Guidelines

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original
- C. building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12” from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- D. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- E. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- F. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- G. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- H. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- I. should not be made by adding new stories.
- J. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.
- K. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

Guidelines

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
  - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
  - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.

Guidelines

- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the bricks should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
  - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
  - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.

Guidelines Cont'd

K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appear

Findings

The proposal to change the siding and openings is within the Guidelines II.A.4.C., II.A.4.E.and II.A.4.I respectively state, “Additions should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.”, “Additions should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building” and “Additions should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.”

As this concrete block addition was later added and not original to the structure, staff finds the residing and change of openings within the Guidelines. Guideline II.B,I,F states, “... Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods.” Staff finds the loss of this door and entrance are not detrimental to the overall character of this side addition since it was a later addition and the entrance was not used. The replacement of the doors with full light window on the front and back of the addition is within the Guidelines. In addition, proposed modern approach to the siding and windows is in keeping with Guideline II.B.I.K which discusses not replicating history and suggest a contemporary approach.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the new addition with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes shall be returned to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

August 11, 2022