

435 North Limestone
Mulberry Hill Historic District

JP Stilz, Owner
Pamela Stilz, Applicant

Scope of Work

Demolish rear addition.

Background

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a rear addition to the primary historic structure. The one story addition is located at the rear of the structure ('B' on PVA plan) and is an open porch at the first floor and enclosed at the second floor. The Sanborn Insurance Company maps indicate that the addition was added after the original construction and prior to 1934. The addition is separating from the rear masonry wall of the historic structure. After demolition the applicant is proposing to rehabilitate the newly exposed rear wall of the historic structure.

Guidelines

VI. Guidelines for Demolition

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

- A. should only occur as a last resort after all other avenues to protect historic buildings and structures have been exhausted.
- B. of any original feature or part of a historic building should be avoided.
- C. of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:
 - 1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
 - 2. The demolition request is for a non-contributing building and the demolition will not adversely affect the character of the district.
 - 3. The property owner proves that no reasonable economic return may be gained from the property through a process designated in Article 13, Section 7(c) (see Appendix E).
- D. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.

Guidelines Cont'd

- E. If tied to future development of the property, future development should be compatible in scale, size and use with existing zoning and existing characteristics of historic properties were the development is located.
- F. For further information about these procedures, consult Article 13 of the Lexington –Fayette Urban County Zoning Ordinance and DHP staff.

Findings

Staff finds that the proposal to demolish the addition meets the Guidelines. The addition has lost any historic fabric and integrity that may have previously existed due to many changes over time. The demolition request “is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR” per Guideline VI.6.C. Additionally the proposal meets Guideline VI.6.D., the “demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.”

The demolition request is for a non-significant addition and the applicant intends to rehabilitate the newly exposed rear masonry wall to its original condition.

Recommendations

Staff recommends that the proposal be approved with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes shall be returned to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

October 23, 2021