

339 Transylvania Park
Aylesford Historic District

Sue Mize, Owner/Applicant

Scope of Work
Replace windows.

Background

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a single and a pair of windows at the second floor level of the front elevation. Staff was conducting site visits on Transylvania Park and observed that windows were being worked on at the subject property without a COA. Staff stopped to determine the extent of the work that was ongoing. Staff talked to a worker who said that they were replacing the three windows in question. The worker went on to state that the windows were in terrible condition and needed to be replaced. Staff had a conversation with the applicant, staff was invited in to inspect the locations of the proposed window replacement. The historic 30/1 wood windows were being replaced with 30/1 Pella 850 Series (aluminum clad) windows.

Staff inspected the window sashes that had been removed and the interior of the structure. Based upon that inspection staff determined that the windows were in good condition with some damaged mutins and chips in the paint of the sashes and that staff could not support replacing the windows based on the Guidelines. Staff informed the applicant of the decision that staff could not support the window replacement and that the case would have to be heard by the Board. Staff left the applicant an application which was submitted shortly after the site visit. This case was scheduled to be heard in the August Board meeting. Staff requested that the applicant delay the case until the September meeting due to a lack of a quorum expected for this case. The applicant sent an email requesting that the case be postponed until the September meeting.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

24. Windows

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Guidelines Cont'd.

Windows:

- A should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.
- E in new openings are not recommended. New openings, when permitted by the review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary façade.
- F and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the face of the building.
- G of steel or other metal designs and that are historic should be preserved and maintained or replaced with new metal windows. Replacement windows should match historic metal windows as closely as possible in size, material, and design.
- H should use appropriate burglar guards that fit within the window frame.

Findings

Staff finds that the proposal to replace window and a pair of windows at the second floor level of the front elevation does not meet the Guidelines. The Design Principle states "Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired." Guideline I.24.A. states windows "should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing

Findings cont'd.

of the openings should be retained and maintained.” Guideline I.24.B. builds on that philosophy, windows “should be repaired rather than replaced.

If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.”

As so often occurs if staff had been able to inspect the windows prior to their removal and new windows having been ordered staff would have been able to make suggestions for the repair and not replacement and could have put the applicant in touch with a contractor that could have provided the knowledge and ability to restore the windows.

Recommendations

Staff recommends that the proposal be denied.

Deadline for Board Action

September 15, 2021