

157 Rosemont Garden
Pensacola Park Historic District

Russell Brown, Applicant and Owner

Scope of Work

Renovate front façade; construct addition

Background

The new owner of this property has been working to renovate this structure, prior to the designation of Historic District, the front porch of this structure was enclosed; the front window and door openings were altered. The owner would like to restore the partial front porch to this structure.

Staff found that work was going on the site and visited the site to talk with the owner. He explained that front has termite damage and that the plan was to shore up the front and make repairs as needed. His intention was to restore part of the porch.

At this time, the owner is requesting that the Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to conduct the following work:

1. Construct a partial new front porch.
2. Change window openings on the front elevation.
3. Reside the front elevation.
4. Construct new addition.
5. Remove handicap ramps and planter beds.

The current front addition has a concrete deck with a filled porch on top, the owner calls this a curtain wall on his plans. The wall system is clad in vinyl and has vinyl windows. The front roof has a gable to the east and the west a flat roof. Per the Sanborns, the gable is original and the flat roof was added when the front porch was filled-in. The applicants would like to retain the shed roof over the enclosed section having the dimensions of 12' by 7'6". They would like to restore the porch over the front gable section. The proposed porch will be 16' -10" by 7'-6". The porch will have a 32" wood railing and new front steps leading out to an existing sidewalk. The existing handicap ramp and planter beds will be removed as part of this project. The applicant is proposing to support the roof with a new square post to a new square brick pier column added to the column.

In addition, the plans call for an expansion of an existing addition having the dimensions 7' by 16". The addition will have a similar roof, wall and foundation system as an existing addition. The existing house is wrapped in vinyl with vinyl windows. They are proposing to use the same material as existing. Vinyl windows, vinyl siding, aluminum wrap and brick foundation. Staff has found that the work has been conducted. The applicant reused the existing vinyl siding, vinyl windows. The roof is continuous with the existing pitch of the main roof and the existing addition. The foundation is brick.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

1. Architectural Details and Features

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

13. Porches

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Porches are one of the most important defining characteristics of historic residences. Original porches should be repaired and maintained. Openness is an important characteristic of porches, and the enclosure of porches with wood or glass panels is not recommended. If replacement of porch elements is required, use materials to closely match original or historic components. Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building’s historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.

Porches:

- A. should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. Porches should not be removed if original.
B. and their details should be retained intact with repair work and replacement of missing parts, such as columns, posts, railings, balusters, decorative molding and trim work, to match the original in design, materials, scale and placement.
D. on the rear and sides of buildings may be enclosed if the height and shape of the porch roof is maintained and the “open” character of the porch is retained with a maximum amount of glass area and a minimum amount of solid area.
E. of brick, concrete or tile may have similar materials used for rebuilding front steps and stairs if needed.

Guidelines cont'd

- G. PVC and/or composite (synthetic) materials are not permitted

14. Porch columns and railings

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Historic porch columns and railings should be retained and repaired with materials to match the original. If the original porch columns and railings are missing, replacement porch columns and railings should be appropriate for the building's architectural style and period.

Porch Columns and Railings:

- A. should be preserved and maintained. If repair is required, use materials to match the original in dimensions and detailing.
- B. often deteriorates first at the bottom next to the porch floor. If this is the case, consider sawing off the deteriorated area and replacing this section to match rather than replacing the entire column.
- C. of aluminum, wrought iron, or vinyl are not appropriate for porches. If replacement of wood columns is necessary, wood is the preferred material. In some material, however, fiberglass may be considered for the column shaft. Fiberglass bases and caps are acceptable.
- D. on front porches should be rebuilt in historic designs if there is documentation of the original columns and railings. Columns, balustrades, and railing should appropriate scaled for the scale of the porch. PVC and/or composite materials are not permitted.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- II.A.4.A. Additions are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- II.A.4.B. Additions should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- II.A.4.C. Additions should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.

Guidelines cont'd

- II.A.4.E. Additions should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- II.A.4.I. Additions should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- II.B.1.D. Roof shape and pitch: Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel form
- II.B.1.E. Orientation to the street: All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- II.B.1.F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches: Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.

- *Entrances and divisional bays:* Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.

Guidelines cont'd

- *Windows:* Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - *Porches and Decks:* Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surround buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance.
Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended.
 - Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter.
Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- II.B.1.G. Foundations: Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- II.B.1.H. Floor-to-ceiling heights: Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- II.B.1.I. Porch height and depth: Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- II.B.1.J. Material and Material Color: Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- *Brick Structures:* If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block and in the district.

Guidelines cont'd

- *Foundations:* Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when appropriate.
- *Frame Structures:* If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- *Porches and Decks:* Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
- *Windows:* The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted

II.B.1.K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).

VI. Guidelines for Demolition

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

- VI.C. Demolition of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:
1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-Significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
 2. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.

Guidelines cont'd

Findings

The proposal to replace the partial front wall system and return it to a porch is within the Design Principle of Porches 1.13 which states, "...Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building's historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right."

Guidelines for demolition of the wall system states V.I.C., states, "Demolition...within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless demolition is for ... a non-Significant portion of a building. This porch infill is not original and its removal will not be detrimental to the character of the house.

While, the proposal to construct an addition is within the Guidelines, the already constructed addition does not meet the Guideline II.A.4, "Additions should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights. The roof does not step down from the main roof nor the existing addition. Also the addition uses of vinyl fascia, soffit walls and windows. Guidelines II.B.J.I "Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed." And "The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted".

Recommendations:

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, return any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Staff recommends disapproval of the addition as constructed.

Deadline for Board Action
April 3, 2021