

625 Sayre Avenue  
South Mill Street Historic District

Rich Mains and Betsy Campbell, Owner/Applicant

Scope of Work

Demolish garage, construct garage, patio and pool. Change opening. Extend drive, landscape.

Background

The applicants are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to conduct the following work:

1. Demolish the existing garage having the dimensions (12'-4 X 20'-5").
2. Extend the driveway.
3. Construct a 1 car garage with a second floor (15'-6" by 26'-4").
4. Construct covered patio off of the garage having he dimensions of 8' by 18'.
5. Install a new 8'-16' photo plunge pool.
6. Construct an "L" shape covered patio measuring 11' by 24.
7. Change an existing window at the back of the house to a door.
8. Construct a concrete stoop leading down on proposed patio.
9. Replace existing double doors.
10. Replace existing fencing with new fencing.

Beginning at the rear of the house, the applicants are requesting to construct/install a new covered porch and patio. The roof will cover the existing addition's low pitch roof then extend and wrap around the entire rear addition. The new roof system will have a 4:12 hip roof that will have dimensional shingle. It is proposed to be supported by wrapped pressure treated 6" by 6" columns. The covered patio will be concrete and the proposed open 12' by 15' patio will be concrete squares with grass between each square.

On the south east elevation, the plans call for a window to change to door and a new stoop be installed.

The applicants are requesting to demolish the existing garage and to construct a single bay, two-story garage. The plans call for the proposed garage to be to be located at the northwest corner of the rear of the property. The driveway will be 9'6" and will extend to meet the new garage. The existing driveway is shared driveway then veers to the north east.

The proposed garage will have a shed roof with covered porch and patio. The roof will have dimensional shingles, and it will be sided with horizontal clapboard siding.. The windows will be a combination of fixed, casement and awning. The proposal calls for a full light door leading out to the covered porch.

Finally the proposal calls for a plunge pool having the dimensions of 8 by 16 by 5'. Then it would be surrounded by stepping stones.

The proposal calls to replace the fencing with new 4' and 6' wood fence.

Guidelines cont'd

II. Guidelines for New Construction

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.

Guidelines cont'd

- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
  - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
  - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be heights consistent with the average of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.

Guidelines cont'd

- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
  - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
  - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).
- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

Guidelines cont'd

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, new accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.  
B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.  
C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.  
D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.  
E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.  
F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.  
G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. Guidelines for site and setting

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property's historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

1. Mechanical Systems

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Modern air conditioning and heating units often require condensers and other units to be placed on the site near buildings. Utility equipment should not be visually dominant or intrusive to the property. Heating and cooling units should be placed at the rear or sides of buildings. The placement of these units at the front of buildings is not appropriate and should be avoided. Screening of these units through shrubbery, fencing or lattice panels is highly recommended. It is also recommended that utility wires on the site be placed underground if possible.

Mechanical Systems:

- A. should be located where they are the least visible and intrusive.  
B. if visible on the sides of buildings, should be screened with shrubbery and/or fencing.

Guidelines cont'd

5. Driveways and Parking Lots

**DESIGN PRINCIPLE:** Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- A. should be maintained.
- B. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.

6. LANDSCAPE, LAND FEATURES, LAND FORMATIONS, VIEWSHEDS  
AND ARCHAEOLOGY

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Landscape, land features, land formations, view sheds and archaeology define many site elements in historic areas throughout Fayette County. These elements include resources above and below the ground surface. As a result, landscape and land features are more difficult to define than built features and elements. Landscape and land features can be either man-made or natural. These features include, but are not limited to: trees and shrubs, decorative gardens, utilitarian (functional) gardens, fields, documented historic topography, archaeological and cultural resources and other land features and land formations.*

Landscape, Land Features, Land Formations, Viewsheds and Archaeology:

- A. that are significant should be preserved and maintained.
- B. that are altered or introduced should be compatible to the site and with surrounding properties.
- C. should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.

7. LANDSCAPE ELEMENTS – POOLS, HOT TUBS, GAZEBOS, PERGOLAS

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: The installation of swimming pools, hot tubs, gazebos, pergolas, etc. should be limited to rear yards. Swimming pools should be screened from view by fencing or landscaping.*

Landscape Elements and Site Elements:

- A. should not be visually intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.
- B. open space should only be developed in scale, use and character with the site and the

VI. GUIDELINES FOR DEMOLITION

**DESIGN PRINCIPLE:** Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

- D. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.

Findings

The proposal to replace the garage with a new garage building is found to be appropriate and within the Guidelines II.B.2.A through II.B.2.D reference size, location, design and material

The proposal to demolish the existing garage is within the Guideline VI D. states, “Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.”

The proposal to install the new patios are within the Guidelines II.A.I.A (patio) Guidelines III.7.A. and III.7.B respectively state: “Landscape elements and site elements should not be visually intrusive or suggest a false sense of history” and “Landscape elements and site elements: open space should only be developed in scale, use and character with the site and the local historic district.” The proposal to re-landscape the yard with patios surrounding the proposed pool is within the Guidelines.

Staff finds the proposal to install a pool within Guidelines III.7.A and III.7.B. which state, “Site elements should not be visually intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.” And “Open space should only be developed in scale, use and character with the site and the local historic district.” The pool is proportioned to the size of the yard and doesn’t overwhelm the site.

The proposed driveway addition meets Guideline III.5.B.C. The driveway is “located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.” The proposed driveway is constructed of “concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.”

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, resubmit any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to issuance of COA.
2. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.

Deadline for BOAR Action

March 13, 2021

*This page intentionally left blank.*