

336 Hampton Court
Northside Historic District

Karl Kuhn, Owner
John Book, Applicant

Scope of Work

Demolish garage, construct auxiliary structure.

Background

The applicants are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to conduct the following work:

1. Demolish garage.
2. Construct an accessory structure.

This case was originally in front of the BOAR in the September 16, 2020 meeting and was continued to allow the applicant to provide additional information. The request is for the demolition of a two bay one story historic garage. The garage was first documented on the 1934 Sanborn Insurance Company map, the same year as the primary structure. The garage is constructed of double wythe brick walls with tile parapet caps on west, north and south sides with the low slope roof draining to the east into a gutter. The west elevation is constructed of wire cut brick up to the roof line and smooth brick at the parapet; a man door with a wood lintel and one double hung window with a brick arch at the head occur in this elevation. A single double hung window a steel angle lintel is located in the south elevation. The two garage doors are located in the east elevation separated by a wood post. There are no openings in the north wall. The combination of wire cut and smooth brick is referenced in the primary structure, notably in the jack arches above the windows details. The roof framing has been replaced with modern lumber covered in a single ply membrane roofing.

The new accessory structure (workshop/office) proposed to replace the historic garage is a single story frame accessory structure of approximately twenty-four foot two inches by twenty-four foot two inches. Brick form the base of the walls with cementitious board siding and corner boards above. The roof is a north/south gable with two gable dormers on the west roof plate. The roofing is architectural composition shingles. Windows are proposed to be Andersen E Series.

Guidelines

- II. Guidelines for New Construction
- B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

Guidelines cont'd.

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.

Guidelines cont'd.

- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.

Guidelines cont'd.

I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.

J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.

- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
- Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
- Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
- Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.

K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).

Guidelines cont'd.

- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, new accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

VI. Guidelines for Demolition

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

Guidelines cont'd.

- A. should only occur as a last resort after all other avenues to protect historic buildings and structures have been exhausted.
- B. of any original feature or part of a historic building should be avoided.
- C. of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:
 - 1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
 - 2. The demolition request is for a non-contributing building and the demolition will not adversely affect the character of the district.
 - 3. The property owner proves that no reasonable economic return may be gained from the property through a process designated in Article 13, Section 7(c) (see Appendix E).
- D. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.
- E. If tied to future development of the property, future development should be compatible in scale, size and use with existing zoning and existing characteristics of historic properties where the development is located.
- F. For further information about these procedures, consult Article 13 of the Lexington –Fayette Urban County Zoning Ordinance and DHP staff.

Findings

As referenced above, the garage is noted on the 1934 Sanborn Insurance Company map, the same as the primary structure. Although the garage has been modified over time it still retains its massing, form and historic character. Staff finds that the proposal to demolish the historic garage does not meet the Guidelines.

The Design Principle states “Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort.” Additionally the proposal does not meet Guideline VI.6.A. and VI.6.B. which state respectively demolition “should only occur as a last resort after all other avenues to protect historic buildings and structures have been exhausted” and “of any original feature or part of a historic building should be avoided.” The proposal does not meet Guideline VI.D. as the demolition would be “detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.”

Findings cont'd

The loss of this historic brick masonry structure would be detrimental to the site and the historic district. Based on the intact form, massing, character and historic integrity the proposal to demolish this garage/accessory building is not within the Design Guidelines.

The proposal to construct a new accessory structure, as submitted, would necessitate the demolition of the existing historic structure, although the revised proposal for the accessory structure meet Guideline II.B.2.A it is “simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.” The proposal also meets II.B.2.B, it is “located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.” Additionally the proposal meets Guidelines II.B.2.C and II.B.2.D which state respectively accessory building should “be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district” and should “preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.”

The existing historic garage/accessory structure should be retained and if more space is desired by the property owner, study should be given to possibly adding a small addition on the south side of the existing structure.

Recommendation

Staff recommends denial of the demolition of the historic garage.

If the BOAR approves the demolition of the historic garage staff recommend approval of the construction of the proposed accessory building with the following recommendations:

1. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, resubmit any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.
2. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.

Deadline for BOAR Action

None at this time per COVID-19 related executive orders.