

251 Kentucky Avenue
Aylesford Historic District

Craig Hardin, Owner and Applicant

Scope of work
Rebuild front porch

Background

The applicant received a staff issued COA to repair/renovate an existing front porch stoop. As the applicant began work realized that the porch did at one point extend the length of the front of the house. Staff reviewed the Sanborn maps and found that the porch did indeed extend the length of the front of the structure.

At this time, the applicant is requesting to restore the front porch.

The front porch of this structure was removed some time ago. The proposed porch is based on Sanborn maps and many of the similar porches in the H-1 District. The porch will be 10’ by 28’ The shed roof with an EPDM membrane. The applicant is proposing that the porch roof be supported by new square 10” tapered fiber glass columns with fiber glass cap and base. The plan calls for a new 36” balustrade system with wood spindles. The porch skirting will be wood vertical planks.

Staff did find on a site visit that the work went further than discussed.

Guidelines

- I. GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND RENOVATION
- 1. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS AND FEATURES
(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
- B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
- C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.

Guidelines cont'd.

- B. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
- C. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
- D. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

9. Foundations

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Foundations in Lexington are most often brick, stone, or concrete masonry walls and/or masonry piers with infill materials. Original foundation materials should be preserved and maintained. Foundations should be repaired and maintained in keeping with masonry guidelines. The installation of lattice panels between brick piers is more historically correct than infilling between the piers with recessed concrete block or other materials. .

Foundations:

- (1.9.) A. should be preserved and maintained in their original design and with original materials and detailing.
- B. with masonry piers should be filled in as traditional for the type and style of the house. Appropriate materials include wood lattice framed panels and decorative vertical wood boards. Lattice panels should be set back from the fronts of the piers.
- C. should not be concealed with concrete block, plywood panels, and corrugated metal, or wood shingles.
- D. if masonry, should be cleaned, repaired, or repointed according to masonry guidelines.
- E. if replacement materials are necessary they should match the historic foundation material as closely as possible and should be installed using similar construction techniques.

13. PORCHES

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Porches are one of the most important defining characteristics of historic residences. Original porches should be repaired and maintained. Openness is an important characteristic of porches, and the enclosure of porches with wood or glass panels is not recommended. If replacement of porch elements is required, use materials to closely match original or historic components. Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building's historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.

Guidelines cont'd.

Porches:

- A. should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. Porches should not be removed if original.
- B. and their details should be retained intact with repair work and replacement of missing parts, such as columns, posts, railings, balusters, decorative molding and trim work, to match the original in design, materials, scale and placement.
- D. on the rear and sides of buildings may be enclosed if the height and shape of the porch roof is maintained and the “open” character of the porch is retained with a maximum amount of glass area and a minimum amount of solid area.
- E. of brick, concrete or tile may have similar materials used for rebuilding front steps and stairs if needed.

14. PORCH COLUMNS AND RAILINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Historic porch columns and railings should be retained and repaired with materials to match the original. If the original porch columns and railings are missing, replacement porch columns and railings should be appropriate for the building's architectural style and period.

Porch Columns and Railings:

- (1.14.)A. should be preserved and maintained. If repair is required, use materials to match the original in dimensions and detailing.
- C. of aluminum, wrought iron, or vinyl are not appropriate for porches. If replacement of wood columns is necessary, wood is the preferred material. In some material, however, fiberglass may be considered for the column shaft. Fiberglass bases and caps are acceptable.
- D. on front porches should be rebuilt in historic designs if there is documentation of the original columns and railings. Columns, balustrades, and railing should appropriate scaled for the scale of the porch. PVC and/or composite materials are not permitted.

Findings

The concept of rebuilding the porch is within the Guidelines and a COA was issued to rebuild the existing rear porch however work as commenced on the total project, staff does not condone work carried out without a COA. The proposal to reconstruct the front porch is appropriate and within Guidelines I.1. A., C, I.14. D., and E which respectively state. “Architectural Details shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building” and “If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.” The joints of the stone foundation provides evidence that there was a porch that extended all the way across the building. The joint of the stone foundation has a nice crisp edges at the corners and then it changes to an informal, messy joint across the length of the building.

The Design Principle states, “Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building’s historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.”

The proposal to use fiberglass columns is within the Guidelines I.14.C which states, “Porch Columns and railings...if replacement of wood columns is necessary, wood is the preferred material. In some material, however, fiberglass may be considered for the column shaft. Fiberglass bases and caps are acceptable.” The railing details are appropriate. Guidelines I.14. E states, “Porch Columns and Railings on front porches should be rebuilt in historic designs if there is documentation of the original columns and railings. Columns, balustrades, and railing should be appropriately scaled for the scale of the porch. PVC and/or composite materials are not permitted”.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior issuances of the COA.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes come back to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

December 8, 2020