

454 East Maxwell/304 Transylvania Park
Aylesford Historic District

Anthony Humphress, Applicant and Owner

Scope of Work

Demolish garage.

Background

The applicant is requesting that the BOAR grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the brick garage. The garage is a one story, two bays built using the same buff brick as the primary structure with two wythe unreinforced walls on a stone foundation. The garage has a gable roof, infilled window openings in the north and south elevations and two wood sliding garage doors in a single opening in the west elevation. The garage is eighteen feet by twenty. From the Sanborn maps it appears as if the garage was constructed concurrently with the primary structure.

The applicant is concerned about the condition of the garage. He states that it would be too costly to remove the walls, pour a new footing and rebuild the garage. The applicant has submitted a structural engineers report to support the demolition request. He intends remove the garage but not enlarge the parking.

Guidelines

VI. GUIDELINES FOR DEMOLITION

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

- A. should only occur as a last resort after all other avenues to protect historic buildings and structures have been exhausted.
- B. of any original feature or part of a historic building should be avoided.
- C. of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:
 - 1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
 - 2. The demolition request is for a non-contributing building and the demolition will not adversely affect the character of the district.
 - 3. The property owner proves that no reasonable economic return may be gained from the property through a process designated in Article 13, Section 7(c) (see Appendix E).

Guidelines Cont'd

- D. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.
- E. If tied to future development of the property, future development should be compatible in scale, size and use with existing zoning and existing characteristics of historic properties where the development is located.
- F. For further information about these procedures, consult Article 13 of the Lexington –Fayette Urban County Zoning Ordinance and DHP staff.

Findings

This is a historic masonry garage that is part of the history of the house, site and streetscape, but the condition is in a state that is beyond renovation. The only method of keeping a garage in this location would require taking down the walls salvaging the brick, constructing a new foundation and slab and the reconstruction of the walls and roof. The result of this would be a new garage using salvaged brick in the location of a historic garage, not in the preservation of the historic garage. The Design Principle for Demolition states, “Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated.” Staff finds that the applicant has demonstrated that the garage is beyond renovation and should be approved for demolition.

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval of the demolition with the following conditions:

1. Fill, finish grade and plant turf grass after demolition.
2. Provide some method of restricting parking such as a curb, wheel block or planting shrubs to prevent parking on the new turf.

Deadline for BOAR Action

December 12, 2019