

445 West Second Street
Western Suburb Historic District

Brooks and Holly Scudder, Owner
Darren Taylor, Applicant

Scope of Work

Construct driveway, herbie corral, garage, deck and screen porch.

Background

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to perform the following work:

1. Construct a wood deck, stairs and screen porch at the rear of the historic structure, the deck is approximately ten feet by fifteen feet constructed of wood with a wood and expanded metal railing system. The deck skirting is also proposed to be constructed with an infill of expanded metal. The screen porch is proposed to be approximately fourteen feet by thirteen feet constructed of wood with an expanded metal skirt, a shed roof covered with asphalt shingles to match the historic structure. Exterior trim is proposed to be cedar and the porch will have half round copper gutters with round copper downspouts.
2. The garage is rectangular in plan located about thirteen feet to the north of the proposed deck and screen porch. The structure is approximately twenty-two feet by fifty-six feet. The garage has one fully enclosed bay on the north end of the structure with three partially enclosed bays to the south. Exterior siding of the enclosed bay is proposed to be board and batten siding, there is a metal man door in the north elevation and a wood garage door in the east elevation. The open bays will have a partial board and batten screen on the west elevation with the south and east elevations completely open. A large circular brick fire pit is located in the southern most bay with a metal hood and chimney located above the fire pit to remove smoke from the fire pit. A large gabled timber truss bearing on cedar wrapped wood posts supports the garage roof which is covered with asphalt shingles which match the historic structure.
3. The site work proposal is for reconstruction of the existing driveway as a two track concrete driveway from the street to the rear of the historic structure and to construct new concrete drive and nineteen by seventy-four foot paved area for access to the proposed garage. Square stone pavers lead from the deck stairs to the garage. A hebie corral is located on the eastern property line.

Guidelines

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

Guidelines Cont'd.

1. Decks/Patio/Verandas/Balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) A. should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to achieve a finished appearance. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)
 - C. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
 - D. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
 - E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.
 - F. Handrails/balustrades of vinyl or composite material are not permitted.
 - G. should be appropriately scaled and not overwhelm the historic structure and site.

3. Porches

Design Principle: Porches are often prominent features of a building and help establish scale, proportion, and rhythm along streetscapes. Construction of a porch on an existing building should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings and the district. Porches should be in keeping with the principal structure's architectural style and not reflect an earlier period style.

Porches:

- A. should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and within the district.
- B. should be compatible with the principal structure's architectural style, and not be of an earlier architectural period.
- C. that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.
- D. railings and balustrades should be of wood or metal. No vinyl or composite materials are permitted.

Guidelines Cont'd.

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.
- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.
- K. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

Guidelines Cont'd.

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.

Guidelines Cont'd.

- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.

Guidelines Cont'd.

- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
 - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
 - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).
- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

Guidelines Cont'd.

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds. New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. Guidelines for site and setting

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property's historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

4. Sidewalks, Walkways and Curbs

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Sidewalks, walkways and curbs in Lexington's historic districts are constructed primarily of concrete with some brick walkways and some limestone curbs. These elements help to define the character of the districts and should be preserved and maintained.

Sidewalks, Walkways, and Curbs:

- A. that are significant paved surfaces should be maintained and preserved.

Guidelines Cont'd.

- B. that are added or altered should be compatible with the principal and accessory
- C. that are added should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.
- D. should be of concrete, stone, or pavers consistent with the characteristic of site and adjacent properties. Blacktop and crush stone is not appropriate. No stamped or colored is permitted.

5. Driveways and Parking Lots

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- A. should be maintained.
- B. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.
- C. should be of concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.
- D. should have their parking areas located in rear yards and be screened with hedges, shrubs or fences as appropriate. Driveways should include concrete tracks where characteristic of the property and historic districts.
- E. should not be sited in front yards. Circular are not permitted.
- F. requiring new curb cuts for access should be kept to a minimum.
- G. on vacant lots between buildings should align edge screening with front elevations/facades of adjacent buildings and on corner lots should have edge screening on both the primary and secondary street.
- H. of refreshed gravel should have appropriate retention element to contain the gravel and retard expansion.

7. Landscape Elements-pools, hot tubs, gazebos pergolas

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: The installation of swimming pools, hot tubs, gazebos, pergolas, etc. should be limited to rear yards. Swimming pools should be screened from view by fencing or landscaping.

Landscape Elements and Site Elements:

- A. should not be visually intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.
- B. open space should only be developed in scale, use and character with the site and the local historic district.

Findings

The Staff finds that the proposal to construct the deck and stairs generally meets the Guidelines as stated in II.A.1.A. & II.A.3.A, the deck/screen porch addition is “compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and within the district.” II.A.3.B. the porch screen/deck addition is “compatible with the principal structure’s architectural style, and not of an earlier architectural period.” Additionally the proposal meets Guidelines II.A.4.A and II.A.4.B which state respectively the addition is “appropriately located at the rear of building” and is “secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement.” Finally, in keeping with II.A.4.C the proposed screen porch/deck addition the staff does find that the use of expanded metal for both the railing infill and the skirting is not “compatible design in keeping with the original building's design. Typically railings and skirts are of different designs with railings having a more open character and skirting a more dense character.

Construction of the proposed garage meets Guideline II.B.2.A. which states accessory buildings should be “simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.” The garage needs to be pushed back to approximately twenty five feet off of the proposed deck to be “located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building” per II.B.2.B. The relocation would also help to meet III.7.B which states “open space should only be developed in scale, use and character with the site” to have a greater greenspace between the Gathering Space/Patio and the historic structure. The garage meets II.B.2.G, the garage design “follows design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings” II.B.2.G.

The proposal for the driveway, parking and walks meets the Guidelines as stated in III.4.B and III.4.C the proposed walks “that are added or altered should be compatible with the principal and accessory structures on the property and surrounding historic properties” and walks “that are added should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.” The walks are “concrete, stone, or pavers consistent with the characteristic of site and adjacent properties” per Guideline III.4.D. Guideline III.5.B requires that driveways “that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.” The driveway and parking is proposed to be concrete III.5.C. The parking is located “located in rear yard... includes concrete tracks...” per III.5.D.

Recommendations

Staff recommends the approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following recommendations:

1. Change the expanded metal railing infill to another more open design, submit final details to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
2. Assure that the expanded metal skirting has openings of between one inch and one and one-half inch.
3. Change the paving of the gathering space/patio bay to pavers.
4. Locate the garage twenty-five feet from the deck.
5. Move the herbie corral to the north of the garage, submit final details to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
6. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
7. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, resubmit any changes to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

August 13, 2018