

501 West Short Street
Western Suburbs Historic District

Catholic Diocese of Lexington, Owner
Jeff Pearson, Pearson & Peters Architects, Applicant

Scope of Work

Change openings in addition

Background

The applicants have been working with the church to renovate the structure and site. A few years ago the structure was renovated which included extensive masonry work.

Now they are working to upgrade the drainage system. This work also includes new landscaping, walkways and handrails. Staff has issued a COA for this work. As part of this project, the applicants are requesting that the BOAR grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify openings in the later rear addition of the structure.

The proposal calls for the relocation of the east door onto the north elevation. The window on the north side will be relocated to the east elevation. In addition, the masonry will be rebuilt below the relocated window the east elevation. According to the note on the plan: "Rework existing door & window at rear porch. Door, frame, sill & transom window from east side to be relocated to north side to be relocated to door opening on east side, including stone sill & brick veneer below, cut & patch wall as necessary re-paint all reworked trims, casing & frames to match existing."(sic) The windows are not original.

The door opening is 32" wide and the opening is 30" wide. An additional notes discusses the difference in opening size and the modification that will occur.

Guidelines

- I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation
- 7. Doors

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: As points of entry, doors and door surrounds are important features in defining the style and character of a building. Significant doors should be preserved and maintained and significant features should be repaired rather than replaced.

Doors:

- (I.7.)A. and/or their surrounds, sidelights, transoms, and detailing should not be removed or altered if significant to the building. Original framing such as jamb, sill, and headers of openings should be retained/maintained.
- B. that cannot be repaired or that are missing may be replaced. Replacement doors should match the historic door in materials and size, and should be appropriate for the style and period of the building. They should have the same series of panels and have a frame of the same dimensions. Door replacement should be based on documented research and/or historic photographs. Neighboring buildings of the same style and similar date of construction may provide guidance for identifying appropriate doors. In replacing missing

Guidelines (cont'd)

- original doors, replacement doors should be similar in design to the original in style, materials, glazing (glass area) and lights (pane configuration).
- C. and door units that are standard may be permitted with no more than a 1" width and height variance from historic openings.
 - D. openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is allowed by the BOAR, infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the building face.
 - E. installing new door openings is not recommended. New openings, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on side or rear elevations rather than the main façade.

24. Windows

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Windows:

- I.24.A. should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B. Should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C. If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D. should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.
- E. in new openings are not recommended. New openings, when permitted by the review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary façade.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- F. and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2” to 6” back from the face of the building.
- G. of steel or other metal designs and that are historic should be preserved and maintained or replaced with new metal windows. Replacement windows should match historic metal windows as closely as possible in size, material, and design.

Findings

The relocation of the openings is within the Guidelines. Guideline 1.7.E states “Installing new door openings is not recommended. New openings, when permitted, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement, and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on side or rear elevations rather than the main façade.” and I.24. E and states, “...New openings, when permitted by this review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary facades.” This is a later addition and the window were replaced some time ago and are currently vinyl. The replacement will not disrupt the opening to solid ratio.

Recommendations

The staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
2. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes come back to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

October 16, 2017