

625 East Main Street  
Bell Court Historic District

Sarah Smith, Owner  
Jack Stewart, AIA, Applicant

Scope of Work

Construct garage and driveway, rear porch and patio and perimeter brick wall and change openings in existing garage.

Background

Background

The applicant who is providing professional services for a potential purchaser of this property is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. Construct a new covered porch on the rear of the historic structure. The porch is approximately fourteen foot by twenty foot with a paver floor on a concrete slab and footing. Round doric columns infilled with a wood railing support a low slope roof covered with standing seam copper roofing.
2. Remove the existing patio and construct a new patio. A new brick patio of approximately twenty feet by sixteen feet is proposed in the place of the existing recently constructed patio that is proposed for removal.
3. Construct a new garage with a residence on the second floor and driveway. Zoning for this property is R-3-PLANNED NBHD RESIDENTIAL which allows for a second residence on this property all dwelling units must be under a single roof. Although regulations prohibit residences above a garage, guest quarters are allowed above a garage (guest quarters are limited to two appliances in the kitchen). The garage is proposed to be thirty-two feet by twenty-nine feet with a covered entry at the west wall. The first story exterior walls are brick veneer with 1/1 windows in the front and left elevations. Light over panel doors occur in the rear and left walls along with two garage door on the rear elevation. The garage is one one-half story with a residential unit on the second story; shed dormers occur on the north and south roof plates. The dormers and gable ends are covered with seven inch reveal wood clapboard siding.
4. Construct a new brick wall around the perimeter of the rear property lines. A six foot high brick wall with brick pilasters is proposed to run from the northwest corner of the front bay of the structure west and then north to the historic garage and from the northeast corner of the front bay of the historic structure east and then north along the property line around the property to the northeast corner of the historic garage. A gate is proposed in the wall on the north property line along Sayre Avenue to allow access to the new garage.
5. Existing garage, Convert to a use other than automobile parking by permanently closing the historic garage doors and to construct a weather tight wall behind the garage doors. Lengthen the masonry opening and covert the historic window in the east wall of the garage to a door. Outside of the new door will be concrete landing and a walk way to the south to the driveway.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

10. Garages and outbuilding

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Many Lexington-Fayette County properties retain original or added outbuildings. In addition to principal structures, rural and urban areas have a secondary network of smaller buildings and support structures located in back yards, on alleys, and throughout farm complexes. These buildings served a wide variety of purposes including carriage houses, barns, stables, kitchens, gazebos, smoke houses, tenant and alley houses, privies, and other farm structures. Outbuildings in the rural sections of the county are important features in defining the historic growth and development of farmsteads and country houses. Accessory structures contribute to the character of the principal structure, site, streetscape, and historic district and should be preserved and maintained as long as feasible. These accessory structures vary greatly in appearance and materials. Rehabilitation of accessory structures should follow design guidelines established for rehabilitation of principal structures.

Garages and Outbuildings:

- A. that contribute to a property’s historic character, or are original to a property should be preserved and maintained. Significant or historic features such as siding and windows should be repaired or replaced to match the original.
- B. original to a property should not be moved or relocated to another part of the lot.
- C. original doors such as early 20<sup>th</sup> century garage doors should be maintained to the greatest extent possible, but may be retrofitted with modern hardware and custom garage door openers.

24. Windows

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Windows:

- E should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- F should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- G If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- H should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.
- I in new openings are not recommended. New openings, when permitted by the review process, shall be compatible in scale, size, proportion, placement and style to historic openings. New openings should be located on the sides or rear of the building and are discouraged on the primary façade.
- J and their openings should not be enclosed or partially blocked. If infilling is permitted by the review process, the infill materials shall be compatible with the building and shall be placed 2" to 6" back from the face of the building.
- K of steel or other metal designs and that are historic should be preserved and maintained or replaced with new metal windows. Replacement windows should match historic metal windows as closely as possible in size, material, and design.
- L should use appropriate burglar guards that fit within the window frame.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

1. Decks/Patio/Verandas/Balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to match. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)

Guidelines (cont'd)

- F. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
- G. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
- E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.

3. Porches

Design Principle: Porches are often prominent features of a building and help establish scale, proportion, and rhythm along streetscapes. Construction of a porch on an existing building should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings and the district. Porches should be in keeping with the principal structure's architectural style and not reflect an earlier period style.

Porches:

- A. should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and within the district.
- B. should be compatible with the principal structure's architectural style, and not be of an earlier architectural period.
- C. that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
  - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
  - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
  - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
  - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).
- L. Chimneys. Chimneys and other roof features should be incorporated into designs for new construction, provided they do not dominate the building or streetscape and are appropriate to new construction.

2.New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Guidelines (cont'd)

III. Guidelines for site and setting

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property's historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

1. FENCES

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Fences were typically constructed of wood, cast or wrought iron, brick, stone or woven wire. Lexington has a number of historic metal fences. Historic fences should be preserved and maintained. The construction of new fences based upon historic designs and materials is also appropriate. Cast iron or woven wire is preferable for 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> century buildings. Wood fences are also allowed; however, it is important to keep the fence as transparent as possible so as not to obscure the view of the historic building.

Fences:

(III.1 Fences:

- (III.1.) A. of cast iron, stone, metal, wire, or brick that are original to the property should be preserved and maintained or if missing, may be reconstructed based on physical or pictorial evidence.
- B. of cast iron may be added to properties with buildings constructed to the early 20th century. Cast iron fences are not appropriate for buildings built after 1920.
- C. of wood pickets are appropriate for front yards. Wood fences in front yards should be no taller than three feet, have pickets no wider than four inches and set no farther apart than three inches. Woven wire fences in front yards should also not be more than three feet tall.
- D. of wood boards for privacy should be located in rear yards and generally be no taller than six feet (most pre-fabricated wood fence sections are 8' wide by 6' high). Privacy fences of this height should be at least half-way back from the front of the building to the back walls on the side of the house. Privacy fences of flat boards in a single row are more historically correct than shadowbox (alternating boards) designs but both designs are acceptable. Fences with flat tops, "dog ear" or Gothic (pointed tops) designs are all acceptable. "Stockade" designs are discouraged.
- E. of free-standing brick or concrete walls are not appropriate in front yards but are acceptable at rear yards and side yards.
- F. of stone should be repaired/restored with the same material and mortar mix as the historic stone fence. If it is a dry-stacked stone wall, it should remain so. Please be aware that stone fences in Fayette County within the public right-of-way are protected by the Stone Wall Preservation Ordinance Section 14-83 (see following section, Walls) and require permits through the DHP.



Guidelines (cont'd)

4. Sidewalks, Walkways and Curbs

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Sidewalks, walkways and curbs in Lexington's historic districts are constructed primarily of concrete with some brick walkways and some limestone curbs. These elements help to define the character of the districts and should be preserved and maintained.

Sidewalks, Walkways, and Curbs:

- A. that are significant paved surfaces should be maintained and preserved.
- B. that are added or altered should be compatible with the principal and accessory structures on the property and surrounding historic properties.
- C. that are added should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.
- D. should be of concrete, stone, or pavers consistent with the characteristic of site and adjacent properties. Blacktop and crush stone is not appropriate. No stamped or colored is permitted.

5. Driveways and Parking Lots

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- H. should be maintained.
- I. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.
- J. should be of concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.
- K. should have their parking areas located in rear yards and be screened with hedges, shrubs or fences as appropriate. Driveways should include concrete tracks where characteristic of the property and historic districts.
- L. should not be sited in front yards. Circular are not permitted.
- M. requiring new curb cuts for access should be kept to a minimum.
- N. on vacant lots between buildings should align edge screening with front elevations/facades of adjacent buildings and on corner lots should have edge screening on both the primary and secondary street.
- O. of refreshed gravel should have appropriate retention element to contain the gravel and retard expansion.

Findings

1. Staff finds that the construction of a covered porch on the rear of the historic structure meets the guidelines as stated in II.A.3.A the proposed porch is "compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and

Findings (cont'd)

within the district. And II.A.3.B the porch is “compatible with the principal structure’s architectural style, and not be of an earlier architectural period.”

2. Staff finds that the removal of the existing patio which is of later construction and the construction of a new patio is within the guidelines II.A.1.A & C which state respectively Patios “should be located at the rear of buildings” and “should be simple rather than ornate in design.”
3. Staff finds that the construction the new garage with a residence on the second floor is within the guidelines. The design principle “states New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district.” Guideline II.B.2.A state accessory buildings should “be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building” and II.B.2.B “located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.” Additionally guideline II.B.2.C & D which state respectively accessory buildings should “be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district” and should “preferably be of brick or wood siding.” The proposed garage also complies with guideline II.B.2.G in that it follows “design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.”
4. Staff finds the construction of a six foot high brick wall around the rear property line meets the guidelines as stated in III.1.E “free-standing brick or concrete walls are not appropriate in front yards but are acceptable at rear yards and side yards.”
5. The changes to the historic garage requires more discussion; guidelines I.10.A and I.24.A which state respectively garages “that contribute to a property’s historic character, or are original to a property should be preserved and maintained. Significant or historic features such as siding and windows should be repaired or replaced to match the original.” Windows “should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.” The closing in place of the garage doors does meet I.10.C “original doors such as early 20<sup>th</sup> century garage doors should be maintained to the greatest extent possible, but may be retrofitted with modern hardware and custom garage door openers.” Staff finds that the saving of the majority of the historic fabric in the garage by closing the garage doors in place and the change of one window to a door to convert the historic garage to different use while maintaining the overall form and preserving a large portion of its historic fabric outweigh the probability that the garage would require major changes in order to make the garage functional for modern automobiles as seen in other cases that the BOAR has dealt with in the past.

Recommendations

1. Staff recommends approval as submitted for the construction of the covered porch.
2. Staff recommends approval as submitted for the removal of the existing patio and the construction of a brick patio.
3. Staff recommends approval to construct a new garage with a residence on the second floor and driveway with the following conditions:
  - A. Remove the muntins from the two man doors and the second floor window in the left elevation.
4. Staff recommends approval as submitted for the construction of the brick wall around the rear property line.
5. Staff recommends approval as submitted for the changes to the existing garage.

Staff recommends the following conditions for all portions of the project:

5. Reduce the extent of the existing paving adjacent to the existing historic garage and submit to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
6. If any changes are made that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the work.
7. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, any changes come back to staff or Board for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for BOAR Action

August 20, 2017