

440 West Third Street  
Northside Historic District

Bruce and Martha Nicol, Owner  
Angela Forsee, Applicant

Scope of Work

Construct addition with covered stoop; roof over existing raised patio; addition to garage and expand paving.

Background

The new owners of this 1930's Colonial Revival structure are looking to make changes.

At this time, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct the following work:

1. Replace front round front stoop with a square stoop.
2. Addition and covered porch on west side of the house.
3. Expand and construct new roof over existing deck on east side of the house.
4. Construct an addition to the side of the garage.
5. Expand paving.
6. New basement bulkhead access.

Currently, the front porch stoop is brick and an eclipse shape. It has three risers. The proposal calls for the replacement of this stoop with a square front stoop approximately 5'-6" by 8'. The proposed porch will be stone stoop.

The proposal calls for the construction 20'-7" by 11'-2" addition and covered porch to be located on the west side of the house. The addition and porch will be covered by a standing seam metal roof and be clad in Hardie "Artisan" Lap Siding with a 6" exposure. The foundation will be a 2" stone veneer. The rear covered porch will be supported with a 10" box cedar column. It will have a painted metal rail system. The casement windows will be aluminum-clad, multi-pane 6- lite system. The rear door will be multi-paned top light with panels below.

Along the east side of the house the proposal calls for expanding the existing raised brick patio approximately 3' with new brick. The proposal new roof calls for velux skylights within the roof system. The roof will be low slope metal roof. The roof will be supported by the 10" wood square columns. A new metal painted rail system will be installed.

The plans call for the installation of a new bulkhead entrance at the rear of the house. The bulkhead door will be painted steel door.

The plan also calls to construct an addition onto the existing garage. The existing garage is a one-story brick structure. It is on the 1934 Sanborn maps and is constructed of the same brick as the main house. At the June 7, 2017 BOAR meeting, the applicants presented a plan that altered the roof and the walls. The applicants have come back with a plan that calls for the removal of two bays

Background (cont'd)

the replacement of single vehicular door and one pedestrian door. The proposal calls for the construction of a gable roof addition which projects forward from the main garage with a new vehicular bay. The addition will be 12'-10" by 23'. The new addition will overlap the existing garage over the proposed pedestrian door. The roof addition will be raised approximately 3' higher than the existing garage. The roof will be metal standing seam. The east wall of the addition will have a cover roof supported by brackets. The wall will be clad in Hardie "Artisan" horizontal siding with 6" exposure. It will also have two windows flanking top-light bottom panel doors.

Guideline

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

1. Architectural Details and Features

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.  
B. should be repaired rather than replaced.  
C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint "ghosts," removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.  
D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an "imitation historic" appearance, is not allowed.  
E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.  
F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

13. Porches

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Porches are one of the most important defining characteristics of historic residences. Original porches should be repaired and maintained. Openness is an important characteristic of porches, and the enclosure of porches with wood or glass panels is not recommended. If replacement of porch elements is required, use materials to closely match original or historic components. Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building's historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.

Guidelines (cont'd)

Porches:

- A. should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. Porches should not be removed if original.
- B. and their details should be retained intact with repair work and replacement of missing parts, such as columns, posts, railings, balusters, decorative molding and trim work, to match the original in design, materials, scale and placement.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

1. Decks/Patio/Verandas/Balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to match. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)
- C. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
- D. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
- E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.

3. Porches

Design Principle: Porches are often prominent features of a building and help establish scale, proportion, and rhythm along streetscapes. Construction of a porch on an existing building should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings and the district. Porches should be in keeping with the principal structure's architectural style and not reflect an earlier period style.

Porches:

- A. should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and surrounding buildings along the block and within the district.
- B. should be compatible with the principal structure's architectural style, and not be of an earlier architectural period.
- C. that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.

Guidelines (cont'd)

4. Room and wing additions

**DESIGN PRINCIPLE:** In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementious board may be considered for additions.
- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

**DESIGN PRINCIPLE:** New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

Guidelines (cont'd)

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
  - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
  - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches

Guidelines (cont'd)

which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed.

- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
  - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
  - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed.

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. Guidelines for site and setting

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property’s historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

Guidelines (cont'd)

4. Sidewalks, Walkways and Curbs

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Sidewalks, walkways and curbs in Lexington's historic districts are constructed primarily of concrete with some brick walkways and some limestone curbs. These elements help to define the character of the districts and should be preserved and maintained.

Sidewalks, Walkways, and Curbs:

- A. that are significant paved surfaces should be maintained and preserved.
- B. that are added or altered should be compatible with the principal and accessory structures on the property and surrounding historic properties.
- C. that are added should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.

5. Driveways and Parking Lots

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- A. should be maintained.
- B. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.
- C. should be of concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.
- D. should have their parking areas located in rear yards and be screened with hedges, shrubs or fences as appropriate. Driveways should include concrete tracks where characteristic of the property and historic districts.
- E. should not be sited in front yards.
- F. requiring new curb cuts for access should be kept to a minimum.
- G. On vacant lots between buildings should align edge screening with front elevations/facades of adjacent buildings and on corner lots should have edge screening on both the primary and secondary street.
- H. Driveways and parking lots shall have appropriate retention elements to retain gravel and retard expansion.

6. Landscape, land features, land formations, view sheds and archaeology.

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Landscape, land features, land formations, view sheds and archaeology define many site elements in historic areas throughout Fayette County. These elements include resources above and below the ground surface. As a result, landscape and land features are more difficult to define than built features and elements. Landscape and land features can be either man-made or natural. These features include, but are not limited to: trees and shrubs, decorative gardens, utilitarian (functional) gardens, fields, documented historic topography, archaeological and cultural resources and other land features and land formations.

Landscape, Land Features, Land Formations, Viewsheds and Archaeology:

- A. that are significant should be preserved and maintained.
- B. that are altered or introduced should be compatible to the site and with surrounding properties.



Guidelines (cont'd)

- C. should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.
- D. should not be created by the demolition of existing structures.
- E. of open space should only be developed in scale and character with the neighborhood or designated historic landmark.
- F. of vistas and approaches should be preserved and maintained.
- G. trees with trunks greater than 10 inches in diameter should not be removed unless diseased or unsafe.
- H. new construction or rehabilitation activity should work around trees with trunks greater than 10 inches in diameter.
- I. the determination of archaeological/cultural resource significance is recommended before site work begins. If archaeological or cultural significance is determined, this should guide proposed alterations, new construction or demolition.

Findings

The proposal to replace the front porch stoop requires further discussion. There are no historic or photographic evidence to indicate that the porch stoop is original or a replacement. Guidelines 1.1.13. states, "Porches should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing..." Guidelines II.A.3.A and B state, "Porches should be compatible in scale and materials..." and "Porches should be compatible with the principal structure's style and not be of an earlier period."

The proposal for the construction of the side addition and covered porch is within Guidelines II.A.4 which states, "Additions are most appropriately located at the rear of building."; "... exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12"; "should be a compatible design." However, the staff finds that the window and new door should be one-lite in lieu of multi-paned to further distinguish the addition as new. Guideline II.B.1K states, "Installation of ornament or details that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance is not allowed." In addition care should be taken to ensure the stone pattern that abuts the existing stone will not mimic the existing.

The proposal for the roof and the expansion of the side porch is within the Guidelines II.1. A and D. which states, "Patios/Verandas should be located at the rear of the building". In addition, "II.3.D states, "Porch railings should be of wood or metal..." and II.A.5 which states, " ... other roof additions such as decks, or balconies should only be added when in character with the existing building."

The proposal to alter and construct a new addition onto the garage requires further discussion. The alteration of the front bay by the removing the middle column and the insertion of a vehicular and pedestrian door is within Guidelines II.B.1 F. which states, "Entrances should be compatible in adjacent and surrounds buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs..."

Guidelines (cont'd)

The proposed addition to the garage is with the Guidelines *The Design Principle for Room and Wing addition* states, “In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building’s overall form and plan.” The *Design Principles for Accessory Buildings* states, “New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site.”

The proposal to install additional paving is not within the keeping with the Guidelines III.5. which states, “Driveways that are new should...and not be visually dominant.” Staff finds within the Guidelines that the amount of paving is excessive and obtrusive. Staff suggest that large triangle of new paving should be eliminated closer to the house and that the driveway have only a small hammerhead turn around to exit the rear yard.

The proposal to install a new bulkhead is appropriate and within the Guidelines II.B.1.F. which states, “Entrances shall be compatible in adjacent and surrounding buildings.”

Recommendations

Staff recommends the following conditions:

1. The door and window on the new addition be 1 lite in lieu of multi-panel.
2. Final details of the stone come back to staff.
3. The paving needs to be reduced and final details come back.
4. All final details need to be submitted prior to the issuance of a permit.
5. If any changes need to be made after work is started that alter the information submitted, resubmit the changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of the affected work.
6. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, resubmit any changes to staff or for review and approval prior to the start of work.

Deadline for Board Action

August 21, 2017