Case No. 11660401-B Attachment 5

401 North Limestone Perry Sholes, Owner
Mulberry Hill Historic District

Scope of Work
Replace windows

Background

Staff noticed that the windows of this ca. 1990's brick structure were replaced with new vinyl windows. Staff contacted property owner regarding the replacement.

After some research, staff found out that many of the units in this structure were owned as rental property by one person and several of these units were sold as townhouse to new property owners.

At this time, this new property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to
1. Replace 13 wood windows vinyl windows.

These are complete window systems including vinyl brick mould.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation
1. Architectural Details and Features
(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:
(I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint "ghosts," removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an "imitation historic" appearance, is not allowed.
E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

Guidelines cont'd

23. STORM WINDOWS AND DOORS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: The installation of storm windows and doors can help in lowering energy costs and are appropriate for older structures. They provide additional protection from the weather and can be effective tools in retaining historic windows. They must, however, be carefully integrated with historic framing and details. Storm windows and doors should be full-view design. Storm windows may have a central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window behind it. Storm windows and doors shall be of painted wood, anodized aluminum or baked enamel. Unfinished aluminum storm windows and doors are not allowed. The addition of window screens to historic windows is appropriate as long as the screens are full-view design or have a central meeting rail to match the historic window.

Storm Windows and Screens:

(1.23.) A. should be wood, baked-on enamel or anodized aluminum and fit within the window frames, not overlap the frames.

B. should be full-view design or with the central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window.

C. with built-in lower screen panels are allowed.

24. WINDOWS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Windows:

F should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.

G should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.

Guidelines cont'd

H If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light

I window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.

J should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.

Findings

This proposal requires careful consideration. Prior to replacement staff requires a review of the windows to determine if they are candidate for replacement; however, staff was not able to review the windows because they were already replaced without a COA permit. The inspection information submitted with the application alludes to the windows being in poor shape. These units were constructed in 1990 and did receive a Certificate of Appropriateness in 1989. Staff researched the Historic Preservation files of this address and looked closely at meeting minutes and the original plans to determine if the windows were proposed to be vinyl at the time of construction. Staff determined that vinyl siding was allowed on the rear addition and in the soffit; however, the plans called for wood windows. Staff conducted a survey of the existing units and found that except for the most recent units that have had windows replaced with vinyl windows, that the windows units were wood.

Design Guidelines Design Principle for Windows states, "Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed." Staff finds that any replacement should match in material, size and design and that if the building had wood windows, they should remain wood windows. The replacement of wood windows with vinyl windows is not within the Guidelines.

Recommendations

Staff recommends disapproval of the application to replace the windows with vinyl

Deadline for Board Action
November 29, 2016