

207 South Limestone  
South Hill Historic District

JJ 2007, LLC. Owner  
Graze LLC, Applicant

Scope of work  
Construct two decks

Additional Background

In 2013, the owners of this t-plan cottage changed the use of this from a residence to a restaurant. At that time, the owners requested that the Board grant a COA to:

1. Install a new projecting arm sign.
2. Construct a new 7' by 7' outbuilding in rear yard.
3. Expand the brick paved surface.
4. Replace retaining wall material and reduce the size of the retained area.

(From staff report of 2013)Part of the application requests the small courtyard to the south of structure, which presently consists of a brick laid walkway and terraced planting beds that gradually increase as the slope of the neighboring property increase. The terraced beds are held in place by pressure treated 4" by 4" wood members. The owner proposes to make new planting beds along the south property line with an interlocking masonry retaining wall. The new beds will be 2 ½ feet from the property line including the block wall. The block wall will taper out as process down to grade for a total of 3' from existing grade. The rear existing southwest corner is at higher grade. The new retaining wall system will be at the same grade, 4', and then gradually decrease to 2'. The plan then calls for relaying the existing brick walkway/patio in sand and expanding it by 200 square feet between the existing cover wood stoop/bulk head and existing rear stairs. Lastly, they would like to add a walkway leading from the existing brick patio area to the rear yard. The applicants state they are unsure if that would be a paved concrete walk or concrete stepping stones.

Background

At this time, the new tenants are installing a new restaurant in the structure and are requesting that the BOAR grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct the following work:

1. Install a 6' by 5' by 12" wood deck in the front yard of the structure between the porch and fence.
2. Install a new 4' by 18' by 12" deck alongside the structure in the side yard of the property.

The applicants hope to gain more outdoor seating by installing the decks. The decks will be stained.

Guidelines

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

1. Decks/Patio/Verandas/Balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to match. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)
- C. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
- D. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
- E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.

B. GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION OF NEW BUILDINGS

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.*

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.

- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.

Guidelines cont'd

- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- *Entrances and divisional bays:* Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - *Frame Structures:* If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - *Porches and Decks:* Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed.

Guidelines cont'd

Findings

The proposal to construct the two decks requires further discussion. Staff finds the proposal to be decking in the front yard is not appropriate nor within the Guidelines. The deck is takes up too much greenspace and is too obtrusive. The Design Principle for decks states, "Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations."

The proposal to construct the side deck is within the Guidelines, however; staff suggests that the deck not surpass the existing side steps in order not to become visually obtrusive. In addition bringing it too close to the existing iron fence would detract from the iron fence. Guidelines II.B.1.I and J. reference porch height, depth and material and Guidelines II.A.I.A and II.A.I.C. respectively reference location and simplicity of design. Staff does suggest that some type of skirting be installed to cover the ends of the decking as it is proposed to be 12" above grade.

Recommendation

Staff recommends denial of the deck in the front yard

Staff recommends approval of the deck in the side yard with the following conditions

1. The deck not to extend pass of the side steps,
2. The deck have some type of "finished skirting"
3. Once review by other LFUCG final details come back to staff.
4. All final details need to come back to staff prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Deadline for Board Action

November 29, 2016