

117 South Ashland Avenue
South Ashland/Central Avenue Historic District

Jennifer Ramsey Hanson, Owner
Lynn Pedigo, Applicant

Scope of Work

Demolish garage construct new garage.

Background

The applicant is requesting that the BOAR grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the garage and to construct a new garage; the new garage will be in the same location as the existing garage that is to be demolished. The garage is two stories, twenty-two feet by thirty-three feet with a roof peak of twenty-five feet six inches above grade. The first story is covered in siding, the second floor is in the roof which consists of a 9/12 gable with the ridge running east to west and includes shed dormers on the north and south roof plates. Fenestration on the first floor is comprised of garage doors multiplane windows and doors. Fenestration on the second floor is comprised of garage doors multiplane windows and doors with the windows on the east and west having arched tops. A wood balcony with a wood rail system occurs on the south side of the second floor. The garage door located on the east side of the first floor is a craftsman style two bay door.

Guidelines

- II. Guidelines for New Construction
- B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings
- 1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington’s historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.

Guidelines Cont'd.

- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.

Guidelines cont'd.

- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- I. Porch height and depth. Porch heights should be consistent with those of adjacent buildings. Buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porch depths should be a minimum of six feet.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Brick Structures: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
 - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
 - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good "sense of belonging" on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance is not allowed.

Guidelines Cont'd.

2. New Accessory Buildings (Garages, Outbuildings, etc.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds, New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted. New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

VI. GUIDELINES FOR DEMOLITION

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.

Demolition:

- A. should only occur as a last resort after all other avenues to protect historic buildings and structures have been exhausted.
- B. of any original feature or part of a historic building should be avoided.
- C. of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:

Guidelines cont'd.

1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
 2. The demolition request is for a non-contributing building and the demolition will not adversely affect the character of the district.
 3. The property owner proves that no reasonable economic return may be gained from the property through a process designated in Article 13, Section 7(c) (see Appendix E).
- D, Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.
- E. If tied to future development of the property, future development should be compatible in scale, size and use with existing zoning and existing characteristics of historic properties were the development is located.
- F. For further information about these procedures, consult Article 13 of the Lexington –Fayette Urban County Zoning Ordinance and DHP staff.

Findings

The proposal to demolish the garage is within the guidelines as stated in:

- IV.C.1. The proposed garage demolition is for a non-significant accessory building.
- IV.D. The proposed garage demolition is not detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.

The proposal to construct the new garage is not within the guidelines but could be brought into compliance with some minor revisions:

- II.A.4.A.B. The proposed new garage is located at the rear of the structure and is secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement.
- II.A.4.E. The proposed garage is compatible with the original building.
- II.A.4.I. The proposed garage is of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house.
- II.B.1.B “The scale (height and width) of the new construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.” In this case the garage height and mass is somewhat overwhelming and the roof appears to exceed the twenty foot height limitations set forth in the LFUCG infill regulations.

Findings cont'd.

- II.B.1.K. The multi-pane windows give an “imitation historic appearance.” false sense of history

Recommendations

The staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Assure that the height at the midpoint of the roof have an elevation no higher than twenty feet above grade.
2. Pull the connection of the rear shed roof at the main gable down to the same elevation as the level as the connection on the front elevation; move the vertical shed wall back from the first floor wall. These changes will provide a visual wrapping of the main roof around the dormers.
3. Change the divided lights to single glass.
4. Provide final door and window details and specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
5. After final review by other LFCUG divisions all details shall be returned to Staff for review and approval prior to the start of any work.

Deadline for BOAR action

November 13, 2016