

111 Dantzler Drive
Seven Parks Historic District

Carter Co. Real Estate LLC, Owner
Patrick Carter and Patrick Taylor, Applicants

Scope of Work
Replace windows

Background

On August 3, 2016 staff made a site visit across from this property. Staff noticed that the windows of this ca. 1940 brick structure were replaced with new vinyl windows and the brick mould was wrapped with aluminum. Staff sent a letter citing them for the following:

1. Replace windows with vinyl window with snap in muntins without Certificate of Appropriateness permit.
2. Wrapping of window surrounds with aluminum.

Staff did tell them that replacement windows required review prior to conducting the work. In addition vinyl and snap in muntins were not permitted within the Design Guidelines.

During one of the many meetings with the applicants, they received a staff issued Certificate of Appropriateness permit for the following work:

1. Renovate structure.
2. Restore front entry way; replacing any deteriorated front elements.
3. Replace roofing with dimensional shingles.
4. Construct property line six foot high wood fence.
5. Replace shutters with new operable shutters.
6. Replace wood panel front door with new wood panel front door.
7. Replace side and rear door with new doors having multi-pane lights and bottom panel.
8. Replace garage door.
9. Remove existing gravel and return to greenspace.
10. Restore side porch to an "open" porch.

At this time they have also made application for the following

1. Replacement of the windows keeping the vinyl windows.
2. Painting the brick.

There were 13 windows replaced. The existing windows were a combination of 5/1 wood windows on the front elevation and 4/1 on the sides with a couple of bathroom windows having 3/1 windows.

The new owners made application for repairs which also called for the restoration of the open porch that once was enclosed. The restoration uncovered brick piers that were painted. The owners are interested in painting the brick to match the piers. They have conducted test patches on the rear of the structure.

Guidelines

I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

1. Architectural Details and Features

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
- B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
- C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
- D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
- E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
- F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

3. Brickwork and Masonry

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Masonry, particularly brick, is a common building material in Lexington. Masonry also includes tile, terra cotta, stone, cast stone, and concrete as well as mortar. Color, texture, mortar joints and patterns of masonry define the overall character of masonry buildings. Brick can last indefinitely if it is well maintained. The key to brick and mortar preservation is to keep out water and continue to use a soft mortar when repair is needed. Masonry should be cleaned only to prevent additional accumulation of pollutants and other corrosive elements. Abrasive cleaning such as sandblasting erodes the skin of the brick and is not allowed.

Stone exteriors, foundations, and other features are integral to a building's character and should be preserved and maintained. Stone retaining walls, gate posts, and other historic landscape features should also be preserved and maintained.

Brickwork and Masonry:

- (I.3) A. materials original to the building should be preserved and maintained.
- B. should never be sandblasted or subjected to any kind of abrasive cleaning.
- C. should never be cleaned with high pressure water which exceeds 600 pounds per square inch (PSI).
- D. should be cleaned with detergent cleansers if needed. If brick or stone walls have bad stains or to loosen paint it is fine to use chemical stain and paint removers. Chemical cleaning can be tricky and messy so professional help is advised for these kinds of jobs. If chemical cleaners or paint removers are used on brick or stone, always conduct a small test patch first

Guidelines (cont'd)

- on an inconspicuous part of the building to determine the effects of the chemicals.
- E. should be cleaned only when necessary to remove bad stains or paint build up. If there are only a few small stains or a little dirt on the walls it may be best to leave it alone. Avoid putting water or chemicals into walls whenever possible.
- F. should not be treated with water-repellent coatings unless repairs and remedies such as providing adequate drainage off of and away from the building have failed to stop water penetration problems.
- G. should not be covered with silicone-based water sealants or liquid siding. Water sealants and liquid siding can trap water on the interior of the building and damage the inside walls.
- H. that has never been painted should not be painted.
- I. that was historically painted should remain painted.
- N. should not be obscured, covered, or removed if original.

23. STORM WINDOWS AND DOORS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: The installation of storm windows and doors can help in lowering energy costs and are appropriate for older structures. They provide additional protection from the weather and can be effective tools in retaining historic windows. They must, however, be carefully integrated with historic framing and details. Storm windows and doors should be full-view design. Storm windows may have a central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window behind it. Storm windows and doors shall be of painted wood, anodized aluminum or baked enamel. Unfinished aluminum storm windows and doors are not allowed. The addition of window screens to historic windows is appropriate as long as the screens are full-view design or have a central meeting rail to match the historic window.

Storm Windows and Screens:

- (1.23.) A. should be wood, baked-on enamel or anodized aluminum and fit within the window frames, not overlap the frames.
- B. should be full-view design or with the central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window.
- C. with built-in lower screen panels are allowed.

24. WINDOWS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.

Guidelines (cont'd)

Windows:

- A should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.

Findings

The proposal requires careful consideration. Typically, staff reviews the windows prior to replacement to determine if they are a candidate for replacement; however, staff was not able to review the windows because they were already replaced without a COA permit.

The replacement of the existing historic sashes and the installation of new sashes is not appropriate nor in keeping with the LFUCG Design Principle, "DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed." Staff finds that if any replacement should occur it should match in material, size and design.

In addition, it is not appropriate nor within the Design Guidelines to wrap the surround/brick mould. Guidelines I.IK states, "Architectural details should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

Findings (cont'd)

Unpainted brick is an important architectural feature of this c. 1940 structure. Historically, these bricks were not painted and should remain unpainted. As stated in Guideline I.13. H, "Brick that was never been historically painted should not be painted". This structure suffers from a previous sloppy paint job and should be cleaned versus painted.

Recommendations

Staff recommends disapproval of the application to replace the windows and the painting of the brick.

Deadline for Board Action

October 11, 2016