

255 South Hanover Avenue
Ashland Park Historic District

Cecily & Charles Beach, Owner
Thomas Wilmes, Applicant

Scope of Work

Demolish rear porch and rear entry and construct a two story addition.

Background

The applicant is requesting that the Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the rear porch and rear entry and to construct a two story addition. The portions of the structure proposed for demolition have been severely modified and have lost any historic significance. The proposed addition is an ell plan to be constructed where the current porches and a stone patio are currently located. The addition has a one story brick and glass portion to the south with a hip roof covered in standing seam terne metal roofing. The two story wing is a screen porch on the first floor with a fully enclosed second floor covered with painted wood siding and trim; the second floor fenestration is made up of fixed and 1/1 divided light windows. A cornice to match the existing house caps the walls. The roof is a combination of a hip and gable with tile to integrate with the existing structures' roof.

Guidelines

II. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

13. Porches

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Porches are one of the most important defining characteristics of historic residences. Original porches should be repaired and maintained. Openness is an important characteristic of porches, and the enclosure of porches with wood or glass panels is not recommended. If replacement of porch elements is required, use materials to closely match original or historic components. Rebuilt, replacement or new porches need to be compatible to the structure on which they are built and to those on adjacent properties. In some cases houses have porches of a later architectural period than the main building. These porches reflect the building's historical evolution and may be significant features in their own right.

Porches:

- B. should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. Porches should not be removed if original.
- B. and their details should be retained intact with repair work and replacement of missing parts, such as columns, posts, railings, balusters, decorative molding and trim work, to match the original in design, materials, scale and placement.
- C. on the fronts of houses should not be enclosed with wood or glass. If enclosing a porch is allowed by the BOAR, infill glass and materials shall be detailed to maintain the integrity of the porch elements. Infill glass shall be clear.
- D. on the rear and sides of buildings may be enclosed if the height and shape of the porch roof is maintained and the "open" character of the porch is retained with a maximum amount of glass area and a minimum amount of solid area.

Guidelines Cont'd

- E. of brick, concrete or tile may have similar materials used for rebuilding front steps and stairs if needed.
- F. may be screened if the structural framework for the screen panels is minimal and the open appearance of the porch is maintained. Wood framing for the screen panels is preferred, however, anodized or baked enamel aluminum frames may be considered. The use of "raw" or milled aluminum framing is not appropriate.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- K. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- L. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- M. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- N. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- O. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- P. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- Q. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- R. should not be made by adding new stories.
- S. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementious board may be considered for additions.
- T. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

Findings

- I.13.A. States the porches “should be maintained in their original configuration and with original materials and detailing. Porches should not be removed if original.” The staff finds that the entry and porch have already been severely modified and are not in their original state.
- II.A.4.A. The addition is “appropriately located at the rear of building.”
- II.A.4.B. The exterior walls of the addition do not step “in a minimum of 12” from the edges of the existing building.”
- II.A.4.C. The proposed addition is “compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.”
- II.A.4.I. The proposed addition is “of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.”

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Step in the walls to expose the corners of the historic structure.
2. Provide window details and specifications to the staff for review prior to the issuance of a COA.
3. After review by other LFUCG divisions submit any changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of any work.

Deadline for Board Action

September 26, 2016