

567 West Short Street
Western Suburb Historic District

Dr. Blake Bradley Owner
Craig Rushing Applicant

Scope of Work

Extend the driveway and construct auto court; construct porch addition, patio and a new carport.

Background

The owner is requesting that the BOAR grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to add a two story addition and patio to the rear of the historic structure, extend the exiting driveway into the back yard, create a motor court and build a new carport. The BOAR heard and approved with conditions a similar proposal on September 9, 2015; the Certificate of Appropriateness was never issued for that case. The previous proposal has been modified by a new applicant and submitted under this case.

Addition: The proposed addition is a two story open porch of steel construction; a low slope roof that with an open trellis covers the second floor. The porch covers the total rear elevation of the historic structure as well as the rear of a later frame addition. The existing addition occurs towards the rear of the structure on the east side of the plan, the existing addition is two stories high with siding and a metal roofed hip shape roof. The west side of the proposed addition is partially enclosed by an inverted tee shaped stone wall and chimney that serves to screen the porch from the adjacent property.

Carport: The carport sets on the north side of the proposed motor court and has a plan that measures 32’-6” x 24’-0” and provides parking for three vehicles. The carport shed roof is supported by steel tube columns and is finished with a standing seam metal roof. The carport is open on three and a half sides with a portion of the north side containing two enclosed storage areas. The enclosed portion is covered with siding.

Driveway/Motor Court: The proposed driveway is a paved extension of the existing driveway located on the east side of the site running north to the proposed auto court which is located at the front of the carport.

Guidelines

- II. Guidelines for New Construction
 - A. Guidelines for additions to buildings
 - 1. Decks/patios/verandas/balconies

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Decks and patios or verandas are non-original additions to historic buildings and should be designed to be as compatible as possible. When building a new deck or patio it should be placed at the rear or side elevations. Decks and patios are not appropriate for placement on primary elevations. Second story balconies may also be added, but are limited to rear elevations and should be as unobtrusive as possible.

Guidelines cont'd

Decks/Patios/Verandas/Balconies:

- (II.A. 1.A) should be located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be stained or painted to match. (Note: treated lumber should season for an adequate time prior to applying finish.)
- G. should be simple rather than ornate in design. It is recommended that wood decks have square wood balusters set no more than three inches apart. Balusters should be no more than 2" in width and depth.
- H. railings should continue the line and spacing of existing balustrades.
- E. second story decks and balconies should not be built on primary elevations, but may be appropriate on rear elevations.

4. ROOM AND WING ADDITIONS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.
- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementitious board may be considered for additions.

Guidelines cont'd

- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

B. GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION OF NEW BUILDINGS

2. NEW ACCESSORY BUILDINGS (GARAGES, OUTBUILDINGS, ETC.)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds. New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2) A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building
- B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
- C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
- D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
- E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
- F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
- G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. GUIDELINES FOR SITE AND SETTING

5. Driveways and Parking Lots

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- A. should be maintained.
- B. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.
- C. should be of concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.

Guidelines cont'd

- D. should have their parking areas located in rear yards and be screened with hedges, shrubs or fences as appropriate. Driveways should include concrete tracks where characteristic of the property and historic districts.
- E. should not be sited in front yards.
- F. requiring new curb cuts for access should be kept to a minimum.
- G. On vacant lots between buildings should align edge screening with front elevations/facades of adjacent buildings and on corner lots should have edge screening on both the primary and secondary street.
- H. Driveways and parking lots shall have appropriate retention elements to retain gravel and retard expansion.

Findings

Patio: The proposed patio is in compliance with the guidelines.

- II.A.1.A. The proposed patio is “located at the rear of building.”
- II.A.1.C. The proposed patio is a “simple rather than ornate in design.”

Addition: The Staff finds that the proposed addition is in compliance with the Guidelines.

- II.A.4.A. The addition is “appropriately located at the rear of building.”
- II.A.4.B. Any addition “should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement.” The scale of the addition is large in comparison to the historic structure and does not have the appropriate separation from the corners of the structure that requires that “exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12” from the edges of the existing building.” And that “rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.”
- II.A.4.D. The proposed addition does “not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period.”
- II.A.4.E. The proposed addition does “reflect characteristics of the current period in design” and is “compatible with the original building.”
- II.A.4.F&G. The proposed addition is “built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building” and does “keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.”

Carport: The Staff finds that the proposed carport is in compliance with the guidelines.

Findings cont'd

- II.B.2.A. The details of the carport are “simple in design.” and require modification to bring these details into compliance with the “Guidelines.”
- II.B.2.B. The proposed carport is not “located in character with other secondary buildings for the street,” “at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.”
- II.B.2.F. The proposed carport is “carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.”

Driveway/Motor Court: The proposed driveway/motor court is not in compliance with the “Guidelines.”

- III.5.B.C. The driveway/motor court is “located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.” The proposed driveway/motor court is constructed of “concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.”

Recommendations

Staff recommends approval with the following conditions:

1. Submit stone material to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
2. Submit final rail details to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
3. Submit final canopy details to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
4. Submit carport siding material specifications to staff prior to the issuance of a COA.
5. Construct the driveway using a two track design.
6. Reduce the extent of paving.
7. Change the auto court paving to a permeable type such as grassy pavers.
8. Submit patio material to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
9. Final details shall be submitted to the staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
10. Once reviewed by other LFUCG Divisions, all changes shall be returned to the staff for review and approval prior to the start of any work.

Deadline for Board Action

September 26, 2015