

287 South Limestone
South Limestone Historic District

E & G LLC, Owner
Tim Washabaugh, Applicant

Scope of work

Construct addition and dormers

Background

The new owner of this ca. 1901 Princess Anne Style brick 2 ½ story structure is requesting that the Board grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following changes:

1. Remove third story dormer addition.
2. Construct new shed dormers on north and south roof plates (new south dormer to replace removed dormer).
3. Construct a one story addition on an existing basement addition.
4. Construct two-story addition to fill in offset.

The board provides comments on this project during a conceptual review in the July 27, 2016 meeting. The applicant has been working with staff on renovations to this structure and are in the process are making this a mixed use structure with a combination of restaurant and apartments.

Most all of the work will occur on the third floor roof line and the rear first floor. There are no changes requested to the front façade at this time.

The applicant would like to alter the roof line of the structure. The applicant desires to remove a third floor dormer that runs along a majority of the southern roof plate and to replace it with a new shed dormer. On the rear half of the north roof plate, behind the side gable a shorter shed dormer is proposed. In addition, the exterior fire escape system will be retained and altered. The existing fire escape door at the third floor will remain with the gable roof above to be modified to a hip roof.

An existing one story basement addition that is partially above grade is located at the rear of the structure. The proposal calls for the construction of a one story addition on top of the existing basement. The new addition will have a low slope roof enclosed by parapet walls. A walkway occurs on the roof and runs from the fire escape to the west to a stair to grade. The second addition fills in the two story offset located at the southwest corner of the structure. This addition has a hip roof located to connect to the existing structure below the gutter line. Both elevations are proposed to be skinned with clapboard siding.

Guidelines

I. GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND RENOVATION

1. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS AND FEATURES

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- A. (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
- B. If should be repaired rather than replaced.
- C. missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
- D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
- E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
- F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

8. Exterior stairs and fire escapes

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Multi-story buildings used for commercial and/or rental residential uses often require exterior stairs and/or fire escapes to meet fire and safety codes. Fire escapes should be sited at the rear or sides of buildings.

Exterior stairs and Fire Escapes:

- (I.8.) A. should not be added unless required by building codes or where no other means of upper floor access is reasonably feasible.
- B. shall be located on the rear or side of buildings

15. Roofs

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Roof forms contribute greatly to the architectural character of buildings, and original roof forms, including dormers, should be preserved and maintained. Roof materials give the building textural and visual qualities. Historic roof materials such as wood shingles, metal standing seam, clay tiles, or slate should be repaired and preserved. Many times roofs of these materials can be repaired or partially replaced. If additions to roofs are desired such as new dormers or skylights, these should be added at rear or side rooflines and be compatible with the building’s architectural style.

Roofs:

- (I.15.)A. should be preserved in their original size, shape and pitch, with original features (such as cresting, finials, dormers, cupolas, etc.) and, if possible, with original roof material.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- B. should retain original metal valleys and ridgecaps. Open valleys should be retained. Covered valleys (California weave) are not allowed on existing structures.
- D. of standing seam metal should be repaired. If replacement is necessary the new roof should match the original as closely as possible in dimensions, seam crimping, and seam spacing.
- E. new dormers should only be constructed when in keeping with the character and scale of the structure. (See Section VII, Guidelines for New Construction, Roofline additions)
- F. added skylights, decks or dormers should not be placed where readily visible, but should be carefully placed to be compatible and to have the least negative impact on the exterior appearance of the site, structure and adjacent and surrounding buildings.
- G. of asphalt shingle, when necessary, should be replaced with new asphalt shingles. Use of dimensional shingles is recommended. Dimensional shingles are thicker and heavier than standard shingles and generally last much longer.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementious board may be considered for additions.
- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

5. Rooflines additions-Dormers

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: If additions to roofs are desired such as new dormers, these should be added on the rear or side rooflines and be compatible with the building's architectural style and materials.

Dormers:

- A. should be in keeping with the character and scale of the building.
- B. should not be introduced on front elevations, but may be added to rear or secondary elevations if compatible with the building design.
- C. and other roof additions such as decks, or balconies should only be added when in character with the existing building.

B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

1. NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
 - Porches and Decks: Porches and decks should be compatible in scale and materials with the principal structure and with adjacent and surrounding buildings. Placement and scale should be compatible with that of existing buildings along the street and in the historic district. Porches should have roof forms of gable or shed design and at least cover the entrance. Porches which extend partially or fully across the main facade are recommended. Porch columns and railings should be simple in design in square or round

Guidelines (cont'd)

- shapes. Columns should be a minimum of six inches square or in diameter. Porch railings should have balusters which are no less than two inches square or in diameter. Installation of porches that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1’-6” above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material. Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
 - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - Porches and Decks: Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the

Guidelines cont'd

proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).

Findings

The staff finds that

- II.A.4.A&B. The proposed additions are “appropriately located at the rear” of the building and is “secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement.” And the dormer rooflines are “stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.”
- II.A.4.D&E. The proposed additions do “not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period.” And does “reflect characteristics of the current period in design.”
- II.A.4.F&G. The proposed additions are to be “built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.” The proposal keeps “the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.”
- II.A.5.B. The proposed shed roof additions “should not be introduced on front elevations, but may be added to rear or secondary elevations if compatible with the building design.”
- II.B.1.A&B. The additions shape with ‘variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington’s historic districts.’ And the addition’s construction is in “keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width.”

Recommendations

1. Provide material selection to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a COA.
2. Provide window details and specifications to the staff for review prior to the issuance of a COA.
3. After review by other LFUCG divisions submit any changes to staff for review and approval prior to the start of any work.

Deadline for Board Action

September 26, 2016