Conceptual Review Attachment 9

287 South Limestone
South Limestone Historic District

E & G LLC, Owner Tim Washabaugh, Applicant

Scope of work
Construct addition and dormers

Background

The new owner of this ca. 1901Princess Anne Style brick 2 ½ story structure is requesting a Conceptual Review for the following changes:

- 1. Remove third story dormer addition.
- 2. Construct new dormers: with either gables or French style dormers.
- 3. Construct a one story addition atop an existing basement addition.
- 4. Construct two-story addition to fill in offset.
- 5. Change rear main mass roof to a gambrel roof on rear of the structure.

They have been working with staff on renovations to this structure and are in the process are making this a mix use structure with a combination of restaurant and apartments.

Most all of the work will have on the third floor roof line and the rear first floor. There are no changes requested to the front façade at this time.

The applicant would like to alter the roof line of the structure. The applicant is desirous to remove a third floor long dormer and replace it with new dormers. According to the notes the dormers have "no value and is only for aesthetic purposes". He proposes four on south elevation and three on the north elevation. On the rear half of the roof line, behind the side gable on the north side and along the full length of the roof along the south elevation, the plans call to change the roof to a gambrel. In addition, the exterior fire escape system will be retained and altered to extend to new proposed door. The existing upper story door will be replaced with a new window.

Currently, there is a one-story basement addition at the rear of the structure. The proposal calls to install another one-story addition atop of the basement addition. The second addition will be one that fills in the two story offset. The plans call for two types of potential roof forms for the addition: a flat roof and one with a gambrel roof. As stated before the fire escape will be retained and lead onto the proposed first floor addition. Then lead along addition to the back of the structure.

The proposal calls for the construction of a one-story addition will be clad in fibre-cement board.

287 South Limestone

Page 2

Guidelines

- I. GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION AND RENOVATION
- ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS AND FEATURES
 (Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

Architectural Details:

- (I.1.) A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
 - B. If should be repaired rather than replaced.
 - C. missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint "ghosts," removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
 - D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an "imitation historic" appearance, is not allowed.
 - E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
 - F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.
- 8. Exterior stairs and fire escapes

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Multi-story buildings used for commercial and/or rental residential uses often require exterior stairs and/or fire escapes to meet fire and safety codes. Fire escapes should be sited at the rear or sides of buildings.

Exterior stairs and Fire Escapes:

- (1.8.) A. should not be added unless required by building codes or where no other means of upper floor access is reasonably feasible.
 - B. shall be located on the rear or side of buildings
- 15. Roofs

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Roof forms contribute greatly to the architectural character of buildings, and original roof forms, including dormers, should be preserved and maintained. Roof materials give the building textural and visual qualities. Historic roof materials such as wood shingles, metal standing seam, clay tiles, or slate should be repaired and preserved. Many times roofs of these materials can be repaired or partially replaced. If additions to roofs are desired such as new dormers or skylights, these should be added at rear or side rooflines and be compatible with the building's architectural style.

Roofs:

- (I.15.)A. should be preserved in their original size, shape and pitch, with original features (such as cresting, finials, dormers, cupolas, etc.) and, if possible, with original roof material.
 - B. should retain original metal valleys and ridgecaps. Open valleys should be retained. Covered valleys (California weave) are not allowed on existing structures.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- C. of slate should be repaired with new slate to match. If deterioration is extensive consider removing slate from rear roof surfaces in order to repair slate on the main and readily visible facades. If overall removal is demonstrated as necessary, the use of faux-slate materials will be considered. Reproduction materials should be used only when based on historic documentation.
- D. of standing seam metal should be repaired. If replacement is necessary the new roof should match the original as closely as possible in dimensions, seam crimping, and seam spacing.
- D. new dormers should only be constructed when in keeping with the character and scale of the structure. (See Section VII, Guidelines for New Construction, Roofline additions)
- F. added skylights, decks or dormers should not be placed where readily visible, but should be carefully placed to be compatible and to have the least negative impact on the exterior appearance of the site, structure and adjacent and surrounding buildings.
- G. of asphalt shingle, when necessary, should be replaced with new asphalt shingles. Use of dimensional shingles is recommended. Dimensional shingles are thicker and heavier than standard shingles and generally last much longer.

II. Guidelines for New Construction

A. Guidelines for Additions to Buildings

4. Room and wing additions

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: In planning additions, the best approach is to place the additions where they will have the least impact on the building's overall form and plan. The rear of buildings is the best location for the addition of rooms or wings. Exterior walls of new additions should not be flush with those of existing buildings, but should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building. Likewise, addition rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident. Enlarging a property through adding stories is not appropriate.

Additions:

- A. are most appropriately located at the rear of buildings.
- B. should be secondary (smaller and simpler) to the original building in scale, design, and placement. The use of a small connector or link between the addition and the original building is encouraged where appropriate. Exterior walls should be stepped in a minimum of 12" from the edges of the existing building, and rooflines should be stepped down from the peak of the existing roofline so that the existing main roof remains evident.
- C. should be a compatible design in keeping with the original building's design, roof shape, materials, color and location of window, door and cornice heights.
- D. should not imitate an earlier historic style or architectural period. For example, a Greek Revival style rear porch addition would not be appropriate for a Queen Anne style house.
- E. should reflect characteristics of the current period in design, but be compatible with the original building.
- F. should be built in a manner that avoids substantive removal or loss of historic materials and which does not damage or destroy the main architectural features of the building.

287 South Limestone

Page 4

Guidelines (cont'd)

- G. should keep the exterior walls of the original building as intact as possible and use existing door and window openings for connecting the addition to the building.
- H. should not be made by adding new stories.
- I. should be of materials compatible with the historic fabric of the house. The use of wood is most appropriate; however cementious board may be considered for additions.
- J. should have skylights, decks, or balconies placed so that they do not detract from the historic character of the building.

5. Rooflines additions-Dormers

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: If additions to roofs are desired such as new dormers, these should be added on the rear or side rooflines and be compatible with the building's architectural style and materials.

Dormers:

- A. should be in keeping with the character and scale of the building.
- B. should not be introduced on front elevations, but may be added to rear or secondary elevations if compatible with the building design.
- C. and other roof additions such as decks, or balconies should only be added when in character with the existing building.

B. GUIDELINES FOR CONSTRUCTION OF NEW BUILDINGS

NEW PRIMARY BUILDINGS

DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.

New construction of <u>primary buildings</u> should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.

- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
 - Entrances and divisional bays: Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
 - Windows: Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.
- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
 - *Brick Structures*: If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick s should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
 - Foundations: Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material.
 - Lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
 - Frame Structures: If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
 - *Porches and Decks:* Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
 - Windows: The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good "sense of belonging" on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an "imitation historic" appearance is not allowed.

Findings

As this is a Conceptual Review, there are no findings at this time However, but some things to consider include:

- 1. Is it appropriate to construct a one-story addition atop an existing addition?
- 2. Is a flat roof appropriate for the addition?
- 3. Is a gambrel roof appropriate for the addition?

287 South Limestone

Page 6

Findings (cont'd)

- 4. Is it appropriate to alter the roof of the main structure by adding a gambrel roof?
- 5. Is it appropriate to add dormers (either gable or French style to the roof line)?
- 6. Is it appropriate to add a two story fill addition into the off set of rear elevation of the building?
- 7. Do the proposed additions have a contemporary design or does it replicate history?
- 8. Is the mass and form appropriate for this structure?
- 9. Are the new additions compatible with the existing structure?
- 10. Are the openings compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in the adjacent and surrounding buildings?
- 11. Do the architectural details and articulation of the proposed addition relate in scale, rhythm, proportion and texture to existing, adjacent and surrounding historic buildings?
- 12. Are the materials in scale to the building on which they are located and compatible with the materials on the adjacent and surrounding buildings?

Recommendation

None at this time

Deadline for Board Action

None at this time