

834 West Maxwell Street  
Woodward Heights Historic District

Earthman, LLC, Owner  
Brandi Ore, Applicant

Scope of Work

Replace windows

NOTE: Before the Board may hear this case and make any ruling, they must first determine if there is sufficient new evidence to rehear this application since the Board denied a similar request at the April 27<sup>th</sup> Boar meeting and, by ordinance, they are not permitted to rehear the same application within 12 months of a previously denied application.

Background

The applicants are working toward restoring this 1907 t-plan cottage.

At the April 27<sup>th</sup> BOAR meeting, the applicants requested:

1. Replace the windows in the structure.
2. Demolish rear addition and restore siding.
3. Demolish exterior attic landing/porch and steps.
4. Replace upper story door with new window.

Items 2, 3 and 4 were approved. Part of Item #1 was approved and part was disapproved. Of the thirteen windows, three windows were committed to being restored; three were approved to being replaced, however; seven were disapproved for replacement. The applicants would like to window replacement to be re-considered. This is requested “in light of recent work showing extensive damage and decay” according to the applicant.

At this time, the applicant is requesting that the Board of Architectural Review grant a Certificate of Appropriateness to conduct the following work:

1. Replace the seven windows with new aluminum clad windows.

The proposal calls for the windows to be replaced with Eagle aluminum clad windows.

Overall restoration of the structure has commenced.

As they begin to work on the windows, staff met with the contractor assigned to window restoration on several occasion. He had attempted to restore a whole window system including sash and surround but they felt it did not meet their standards of what they were looking for in a finished product. Staff did have a third meeting with the owners and contractors. The sashes were in decent condition; however, the interior jamb surrounds were in more need of repair.

## Guidelines

### I. Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Renovation

#### 1. Architectural Details and Features

(Gingerbread, bargeboards, eaves, brackets, dentils, cornices, moldings, trim work, shingles, columns, pilasters, balusters, or any decorative or character-defining features)

**DESIGN PRINCIPLE:** Architectural detailing is a major component in defining a building's character and style. Historic architectural detailing should be preserved and maintained. If the details need to be replaced, the new materials should match the original as closely as possible. Replacement detail should be based on historic and/or physical evidence or on the availability of architectural elements from other buildings of the same era and style.

#### Architectural Details:

- (I.1.)
- A. shall be maintained/retained and shall not be removed or changed if original to the building.
  - B. should be repaired rather than replaced.
  - C. If missing, may be added to a building if accurately based on physical, pictorial or historical evidence (paint “ghosts,” removed features etc.) or that is consistent with properties of similar design, age and detailing in the surrounding area.
  - D. Including the installation of additional ornament, which gives a building an “imitation historic” appearance, is not allowed.
  - E. If replaced, should approximate the size, shape, material, color, texture and other visual qualities of the original materials.
  - F. should not be covered with vinyl or aluminum or other artificial siding.

### 23. STORM WINDOWS AND DOORS

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: The installation of storm windows and doors can help in lowering energy costs and are appropriate for older structures. They provide additional protection from the weather and can be effective tools in retaining historic windows. They must, however, be carefully integrated with historic framing and details. Storm windows and doors should be full-view design. Storm windows may have a central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window behind it. Storm windows and doors shall be of painted wood, anodized aluminum or baked enamel. Unfinished aluminum storm windows and doors are not allowed. The addition of window screens to historic windows is appropriate as long as the screens are full-view design or have a central meeting rail to match the historic window.*

#### Storm Windows and Screens:

- (1.23.)
- A. should be wood, baked-on enamel or anodized aluminum and fit within the window frames, not overlap the frames.
  - B. should be full-view design or with the central meeting rail at the same location as the historic window.
  - C. with built-in lower screen panels are allowed.

Guidelines (cont'd)

24. WINDOWS

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended. Windows of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad may be considered only if original windows cannot be repaired. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed. Original window openings should not be covered or concealed. They should also not be partially enclosed for the installation of smaller windows. New window openings should not be added on the fronts of buildings and are discouraged but may be acceptable at the rear or sides.*

Windows:

- A should be preserved and maintained in their original location, size and design and with their original materials and numbers of panes. Original framing of the openings should be retained and maintained.
- B should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match historic wood windows as closely as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.
- C If replacements are allowed by the review process, they can be of wood, baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad insulated glass system. Window replacements shall closely match appropriate period wood stiles, rails, and/or muntin profiles. An insulated divided light window shall have an adhered muntin of wood or aluminum with dark, non-metallic spacer bars. The muntin system should not have muntin bars greater than 7/8" wide.
- D should not have snap-on, interior or flush muntins. These muntins are much thinner in profile than the muntins on historic windows and don't provide the opening with the appearance of a historic window.

Findings

Staff has reviewed the condition of the existing windows and the finished product of the window restored by the contractor. The proposal to replace all the historic window sashes and to install a new window system is not appropriate nor within keeping with the LFUCG Design Principle, "DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Window openings, windows, window details, and the size and shape of these elements help establish rhythm, scale and proportion of buildings and reflect architectural style and character. Windows should be maintained or repaired to match the original design. If windows are

### Findings

deteriorated beyond repair, the installation of new wood windows to match the original designs is recommended...” We do find that elements such as the interior jamb, sill and stops are in need of more extensive repair if not replacement but the sashes appear to be in good condition. Staff finds that the contractor has done a superb job of restoring the sashes using recommendations and Guidelines put forward by the National Park Service and once painted would be indistinguishable from historic windows in the original condition. Staff has assessed the windows sashes and finds that they are in good condition but could use new glazing and painting. Guidelines 1.24.A states, “Windows should be repaired rather than replaced. If the review process determines that replacement is necessary due to severe deterioration, the replacement should be in-kind to match the originals in size, material and design. The installation of new wood windows to match the original design is recommended. The installation of baked enamel or anodized aluminum clad windows (not totally of aluminum construction) may be considered. If aluminum clad windows are applied, they should match the historic wood windows as close as possible in their dimensions, profile, depth of muntins and surrounding trim. Vinyl or vinyl clad windows are not allowed.” Staff finds that the windows should be repaired and retained.

### Recommendations

Staff recommends disapproval of the total window replacement.

### Deadline for Board Action

August 31, 2016