

612 West Short Street  
Western Suburbs Historic District

Bates Ventures, Applicant and Owner

### Scope of Work

Demolish garage/construct garage

### Background

At the June 8, 2016 BOAR meeting, the applicant went before the BOAR to request the demolition of a garage and the construct of a new garage. The BOAR stated that they wanted better drawings that would reflect the height of the garage and to rethink the garage shape.

The applicant has revised the plans and resubmitted the plans based on the BOAR meeting and conversations with staff.

The existing garage, having the dimensions of approximately 12' by 16', is one story and oriented along Klair Alley with the bay opening facing west towards the interior of the yard.

At this time, the proposal calls for the demolition of the garage and the construct and relocation of a new garage. The proposed new plan calls for the garage to be two-bay garage with one bay having the dimensions of 22' by 12'-8" and a gable roof. The second bay, which also acts like a carport, sets back approximately 1' and has the dimensions of 12'-8" by 21'-1". It will be open on two sides like a carport with a shed roof connected to the gable of the other bay. The garage will set off the alley 6' per code.

The garage will be clad in fiber-cement board and have a dimensional shingle roof. It will have also one pedestrian doors facing towards the house with a small roof over the door 4' by 30" and it will be covered in shingles. The garage is reduced in size from the June 8 submittal. The garage will be located 6'-9" from the rear of the house. It will be located 9'-10" from the west property line.

### Guidelines

#### II. B. Guidelines for Construction of New Buildings

##### 1. New Primary Buildings

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: New primary buildings should be designed to be compatible with adjacent historic buildings and those along the block. Compatibility is demonstrated by having similar orientation, roof forms, materials, window and door sizes and placement, porch size and location and foundation heights as adjacent buildings. New buildings that are exact replications or reproductions of historic designs are not appropriate. New construction should clearly be recognized as of its time and distinguishable from historic buildings. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious board, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.*

Guidelines (cont'd)

New construction of primary buildings should maintain, not disrupt, the existing pattern of surrounding buildings, the streetscape and the historic district by being similar in:

- (II.B.1)A. Shape. Variations of rectangular and square forms are most appropriate for Lexington's historic districts.
- B. Scale (height and width). New construction should be in keeping with adjacent properties in height and in width. In general, new construction should not vary in height more than 10% from the average along the block and within the historic district. Width should also be consistent with surrounding buildings and buildings throughout the district.
- C. Setback. Consistent setbacks, or distances of the building from the street and adjacent buildings, help to convey a pattern and sense of rhythm along a block or within a district, which adds to the character of the streetscape and the overall district. Placement on the lot of new construction should be consistent with that of adjacent and surrounding buildings along the block and within the historic district. This includes both front and side yard setbacks.
- D. Roof shape and pitch. Roof slope ratio for new construction should be a minimum of 6:12 to a maximum of 12:12 (6:12 refers to six inches of rise to twelve inches of run in measuring slopes). Roof forms of gable and hipped variations are more typical than those of flat, mansard or gambrel forms.
- E. Orientation to the street. All buildings should have the primary entrance on the front of the building. Most houses in Lexington have their fronts oriented towards the street and this characteristic should be maintained by new construction.
- F. Location and proportion of entrances, windows, divisional bays and porches. Openings, such as entrances and windows and architectural features such as divisional bays and porches, are design components that help establish balance, rhythm, scale, proportion and emphasis in a structure. Patterns of these components on buildings along blocks and within districts create a characteristic rhythm for streetscapes and neighborhoods. It is very important that new construction respect the balance, proportion and scale of existing buildings along the block and within the district in regards to these components.
- *Entrances and divisional bays:* Entrances shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. Divisional bays are where the facade of a building is divided into a series of vertical bays or sections using designs such as pilasters and columns and projecting and inset sections. Divisional bays in new construction should be compatible with the balance and proportion of divisional bays in existing buildings on the block and within the district.
  - *Windows:* Window openings shall be compatible in scale, size and proportion to established patterns of openings in adjacent and surrounding buildings. New buildings should have a similar ratio of window openings to solid wall space as adjacent and surrounding buildings as well as buildings in the district.
- G. Foundations. Height of foundations should be a minimum of 1'-6" above grade. Foundation heights should be consistent with the average heights of other buildings on the street and in the historic district.

Guidelines (cont'd)

- H. Floor-to-ceiling heights. Regular patterns of floor-to-ceiling heights along a street and throughout a district help to create a sense of cohesiveness of character as well as balance and proportion. New construction floor-to-ceiling heights should be consistent with the majority of existing buildings along the block, the surrounding neighborhood, and the historic district.
- J. Material and Material Color. Material color, texture, pattern and construction technique help define building character and scale. Materials are incorporated into all parts of buildings, but may vary from building to building. Installation of materials that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance are not allowed. Materials should be in scale to the building on which they are located and should be compatible with materials on adjacent and surrounding buildings. In areas where strong continuity of materials, texture and material color is a factor, the continued use of those materials is strongly recommended.
- *Brick Structures:* If the new construction has a brick exterior, the brick should closely match typical mortar and brick styles and color tones found along the block.
  - *Foundations:* Most foundations are of brick, poured concrete or concrete block. Poured concrete is more appropriate than concrete block. If concrete block is used, a stucco wash is recommended to provide a smooth surface. Split faced concrete block is also an acceptable foundation material.
  - lattice and other appropriate materials should be used as infill between masonry piers, when and in the district appropriate.
  - *Frame Structures:* If the new construction is of frame, the preferred exterior material is horizontal wood siding which is a minimum of four inches and a maximum of six inches in width. The use of smooth cementitious board siding is also acceptable as long as it meets these size recommendations. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - *Porches and Decks:* Porch and deck materials should be appropriate to the building on which they are to be located.
  - *Windows:* The use of wood or anodized or baked enamel aluminum windows is appropriate. Vinyl windows are not allowed. The use of plastic or "snap-in" muntins (window pane dividers) is not permitted.
- K. Details. Architectural details help give a building character and scale. Details include, but are not limited to: corner boards, rake boards, cornices, brackets, downspouts, railings, columns, steps, door and window moldings and decorative elements. Architectural details may be appropriate when they give the building on which they are placed a good “sense of belonging” on a street and within a district. Details should be appropriately scaled for the proposed structure and compatible with other adjacent buildings and the district. Installation of ornament or details that give a building an “imitation historic” appearance is not allowed. New construction may incorporate contemporary material (see above).

Guidelines (cont'd)

2. NEW ACCESSORY BUILDINGS (GARAGES, OUTBUILDINGS, ETC.)

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Accessory buildings serve a variety of purposes and may include, but are not limited to garages, carports and sheds. New accessory buildings should be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings along the block and within the historic district. New accessory buildings should be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the principal building and should be appropriate to and not overwhelm the site. As with principal buildings, new accessory buildings should not be exact replications or reproductions of historic designs. New construction may incorporate contemporary materials such as cementitious boards, fiberglass and aluminum. The use of vinyl is not permitted.*

*New construction of accessory buildings should follow the design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.*

Accessory Buildings should:

- (II.B.2)
- A. be simple in design and considerably smaller in scale than the primary building.
  - B. be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building.
  - C. be compatible in design, shape, materials, and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic district.
  - D. preferably be of brick or wood siding; however, cementitious board and other contemporary sidings may be considered. Vinyl siding is not allowed.
  - E. for garages, wood paneled doors are more appropriate than paneled doors; however, aluminum or steel paneled doors may be considered.
  - F. carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property.
  - G. follow design guidelines established for new construction of primary buildings.

III. GUIDELINES FOR SITE AND SETTING

In addition to buildings, elements of the surrounding site and setting contribute to the character of historic properties. These elements include both natural and manmade features such as trees, fields, gardens, fences, driveways, retaining walls and boundary definers. Historic site elements help to define a property's historic character and appearance. Historic site and setting features should be preserved and maintained.

4. Driveways and Parking Lots

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Significant driveway materials such as brick, concrete and asphalt should be preserved and maintained. New driveway or parking lot surfaces should be of a material appropriate to the site and the historic district. Paving and parking should not be visually dominant. Parking areas should not be sited in front yards but at side or rear locations, as appropriate.*

Guidelines (cont'd)

Driveways and Parking Lots:

- (III.5) A. should be maintained.  
B. that are new, should be located at the side or rear of the building and not be visually dominant.  
C. should be of concrete, asphalt, pavers or grassy pavers.

6. LANDSCAPE, LAND FEATURES, LAND FORMATIONS, VIEWSHEDS AND ARCHAEOLOGY

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Landscape, land features, land formations, view sheds and archaeology define many site elements in historic areas throughout Fayette County. These elements include resources above and below the ground surface. As a result, landscape and land features are more difficult to define than built features and elements. Landscape and land features can be either man-made or natural. These features include, but are not limited to: trees and shrubs, decorative gardens, utilitarian (functional) gardens, fields, documented historic topography, archaeological and cultural resources and other land features and land formations.*

Landscape, Land Features, Land Formations, Viewsheds and Archaeology:

- (III.6) A. that are significant should be preserved and maintained.  
B. that are altered or introduced should be compatible to the site and with surrounding properties.  
C. should not be visually dominant, intrusive or suggest a false sense of history.  
D. should not be created by the demolition of existing structures.  
E. of open space should only be developed in scale and character with the neighborhood or designated historic landmark.  
F. of vistas and approaches should be preserved and maintained.  
G. trees with trunks greater than 10 inches in diameter should not be removed unless diseased or unsafe.  
B. new construction or rehabilitation activity should work around trees with trunks greater than 10 inches in diameter.  
C. the determination of archaeological/cultural resource significance is recommended before site work begins. If archaeological or cultural significance is determined, this should guide proposed alterations, new construction or demolition.

VI. GUIDELINES FOR DEMOLITION

*DESIGN PRINCIPLE: Demolition of historic buildings permanently alters the character of the individual site, streetscape, building or district grouping. Demolition of buildings and structures in historic districts and of landmark structures should only be an action of last resort. Demolition is not permitted within historic districts or on historic sites unless certain conditions are demonstrated. Procedures for demolition are stated in Article 13 of the Lexington-Fayette County Zoning Ordinance.*

Demolition:

- (VI.) C. of a building within a locally designated historic district is not permitted, unless one of the following conditions exists:

Findings (cont'd)

1. The demolition request is for an inappropriate addition, a non-significant portion of a building or non-significant accessory structure provided that the demolition will not adversely affect those parts of a building or buildings that are significant as determined by the BOAR.
- D. Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district.

Findings

The proposal to demolish the existing vinyl sided garage is within the Guidelines. Guideline VI D which states, "Demolition of a structure or building should not be detrimental to the character, scale, rhythm, design and importance of a group of buildings, streetscape or district."

The latest proposed plans to construct a new garage with two-bays are within the Guidelines. Guidelines II.B.2 B, C and F. respectively states, "Accessory buildings be located in character with other secondary buildings for the street, near an alley or at the rear of the property, not close to or attached to the primary building."; "Accessory buildings be compatible in design, shape, materials and roof shape with other secondary buildings in the historic districts..."; "Carports should be compatible with the property and adjacent properties and be located at the rear of the property". The garage has been reduced in size and the roof has been lowered to be more compatible with other outbuildings along the Alley. The proposal to install a small hood roof over the door is within Guideline II.B.2.B as stated above. This garage is still separate from the main structure.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval as submitted with the following conditions:

1. All final door details to come back to staff.
2. Once reviewed by any other LFUCG Division, all changes come back to staff for review and approval prior to the start of any work.

Deadline for Board Action

July 13, 2016